

MS Thesis

**INDIAN 5th GENERATION WARFARE AGAINST
PAKISTAN: AN ANALYSIS OF PAKISTAN'S COUNTER
STRATEGIES**



RESEARCHER

Ayesha Mubeen

239-FSS/MSIR/F22

Supervisor

Maryam Siddiqa Lodhi

DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE AND INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS

FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCE

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY ISLAMABAD PAKISTAN

(Fall 2023)

SUPERVISOR CERTIFICATE

The thesis entitled “India's 5th generation warfare against Pakistan: An analysis of Pakistan's Counter Strategies” submitted by Ayesha Mubeen Registration no. 239-FSS/MSIR/F22 in partial fulfillment of MS degree in International Relations has been completed under my guidance and supervision. I am satisfied with the quality of students research work and allow her to submit this thesis for further process as per IIU rules & regulations.

Signatures: _____

Dr. Maryam Siddiqia Lodhi
Consultant
Iqbal International Institute for
Research & Dialogue (IRD)
IIU

DECLARATION

I hereby solemnly declare that this research work "**INDIAN 5TH GENERATION WARFARE: AN ANALYSIS OF PAKISTAN'S COUNTER STRATEGIES**" neither as a whole, nor as a part has been copied from any source. I have done this research, with supporting report, completely based on my own efforts under the proficient supervision of my research supervisor Dr. Maryam Siddiqa Lodhi and submitted to the Department of International Relations.

Ayesha Mubeen

239-FSS/MSIR/F22

Date: _____

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	i
DEDICATION.....	ii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
CHAPTER 1.....	1
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1. Background of the Study.....	1
1.2. Statement of the Problem.....	3
1.3. Significance of the Study	4
1.4. Rationale of the Study.....	5
1.5. Objectives of the Study	6
1.6. Research Questions.....	6
1.7. Delimitation of the Study.....	7
1.8. Literature Review	7
1.9. Research Gap.....	15
1.10. Theoretical Framework	15
1.11. Research Methodology.....	21
1.11.1. Research Design	21
1.11.2. Population	23
1.11.3. Sampling	23
1.11.4. Instrumentation.....	23
1.11.5. Data Collection.....	23
1.11.6. Data Analysis.....	24
1.12. Organization of the Study.....	26
CHAPTER 2.....	28
INDIAN’S HYBRID WARFARE STRATEGIES AGAINST PAKISTAN.....	28
2.1. Bringing Political Instability	28
2.2. Economic Slowdown	31
2.3. International Defamation Efforts against Pakistan.....	32
2.4. Indian Fifth Generation Warfare against Baluchistan.....	36

2.5. Effects of 5th Generation Warfare on Pakistan	39
2.5.1. Trust Deficit in State Institutions	39
2.5.2. 5 th Generation Warfare and Politics.....	39
2.5.3. Weakening Religious and Social Fabric in Pakistan	40
2.5.4. Pakistan added in FATF Grey List	41
2.5.5. 5 th Generation Warfare & Issues of National Integration	42
2.6. Pakistan’s Responding to India's Fifth-generation Warfare	49
2.6.1. Strengthening Information and Cyber Warfare Capabilities	49
2.6.2. Awareness of 5 th -generation Warfare & National Resilience.....	49
2.6.3. Diplomatic Efforts by Pakistan	50
2.6.4. Economic Cohesion and Political Support	51
2.6.5. Enhanced Security Measures	51
CHAPTER 3.....	53
DETERRENCE AGAINST HYBRID WARFARE/5TH GENERATION WARFARE.....	53
3.1. Operation Zarb-e-Azab	54
3.2. National Action Plan.....	56
3.2.1. Impact of National Action Plan in Context of 5th Generation Warfare	58
3.2.3. National Security Policy of Pakistan 2022-2026 and Fifth Generation Warfare	60
3.3. National Cybersecurity Policy 2021	65
CHAPTER 4.....	73
FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	73
4.1. Conclusion.....	73
4.2. Recommendations for Pakistan to Counter 5GW.....	79
4.2.1. Counter-Strategies to 5th Generation Warfare by Developed Countries & Lessons for Pakistan	80
4.2.2. Finland’s Approach to Deterrence.....	80
4.2.3. Efforts of United States in Integrated Deterrence	81
4.2.4. Sweden’s whole of Society Approach against 5GW.....	82
4.2.5. Russia’s Efforts to combat 5GW.....	82
4.2.6. China and 5GW Strategies.....	83
4.2.7. Strengthening Strategic Communication Capabilities.....	83

4.2.8. Strengthening Cyber Security Infrastructure	84
4.2.9. Fortify Intelligence & Counter-Intelligence Capabilities	84
4.2.10. Foster Resilience in Response and National Cohesion	85
4.2.11. Provision of Funding and Required Resources	85
4.2.12. Influential Public Diplomacy and Soft Power	86
4.2.13. Maintain Nuclear Deterrence	87
4.2.14. Ways to Improve Pakistan’s National Security Policy	87
REFERENCES.....	89

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I want to express my profound gratitude to Allah, the Most Gracious and Most Merciful, whose blessings and guidance have been instrumental throughout this journey, Without His grace this thesis would not have been possible.

First and foremost I am deeply grateful to my Parents and my Sisters (Apa, Affee) whose unwavering support prayers, love, and encouragement have been the foundation of my academic journey. Their sacrifices, guidance and belief in me have been a constant source of strength and motivation. This thesis is dedicated to them too, with all my love and appreciation.

I would like to thank my Supervisor respected **Dr. Maryam Siddiqa Lodhi** who made my research work possible through her professional attitude and guidance.

I am also thankful to the faculty members of the Department of Politics and IR for their support and contribution to my academic development.

I would also like to extend my heartfelt thanks to my Friend Lubna for her assistance and encouragement. Your support has been greatly appreciated.

Thank you all for your contribution and support .

DEDICATION

This study wholeheartedly dedicated to my parents who have been my source of inspiration and gave me strength, to my siblings, mentor who shared their word of advice and encouragements to finish this study.

Lastly, I would like to thank my supervisor Dr. Maryam Siddiqa Lodhi. She gave me support, and her words of encouragement helped me to complete my research work.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ANI	Asian news International
CIB	Coordinated Inauthentic Behavior
FATF	Financial Action Task Force
PTM	Pashtoon Tahafuz Movement
RAW	Research and Analysis Wing
NACTA	National Counter Terrorism Authority
CPEC	China Pakistan Economic Corridor
NAP	National Action Plan
CGPC	Cyber Governance Policy Committee

ABSTRACT

The research aims to investigate the tactics of 5th generation warfare against Pakistan as well as the effective counter strategies in response to those hybrids, unconventional, and non-kinetic threats posed by India. The study does not only provide the comprehensive multidimensional understanding of 5GW but also the ways Pakistan is responding to these threats and coming out of its negative impacts. In the research, the theoretical framework of hybrid warfare theory is employed. It is a multidisciplinary approach from the strategic studies, security studies, and field of international relations. It facilitates the comprehensive understanding and insights of the nature of fifth generation warfare and its impacts. With an application of the concepts of hybrid warfare, cyber resilience, and information dominance the goal of the research is to build an effective analytical foundation which helps in interpreting and investigating the relevant data. The study has employed qualitative methodology and utilized both primary and secondary sources to gather the data. The primary sources include the reports of Disinfo lab, press release, policy statements, and white papers whereas the secondary sources include the books, journal articles, website articles, and columns. However, it is ensured that the data gathered is unbiased and up to date. The research is analytical in nature and the thematic analysis technique is applied on it. Different themes are made to better comprehend and interpret the gathered data. With the analysis of fifth generation warfare tactics of India and Pakistan's response to those threats, the research has identified the gaps in the present counter-strategies of Pakistan and proposes significant policies and measures that can support Pakistan's institutions to deal with those threats actively. Moreover, the research aims to contribute in the field of strategic and security studies by providing the ways to deal with 5GW that affects the national integrity of the country. With the comprehensive analysis of India's 5GW and counter-strategies of Pakistan, the research provides valuable insights and the practical solutions that can support Pakistan in enhancing its cyber defense capabilities. The findings are relevant to the policy makers of Pakistan as well as the security practitioners to come up with better strategies and policies to counter the threats from the India and maintain Pakistan's sovereignty and security in this digital age.

Keywords: 5GW, Cyber, Hybrid, non-kinetic, disinformation, propaganda

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background of the Study

The South Asian region, home to nearly a quarter of the world's population, has been characterized by long-standing geopolitical tensions and strategic rivalries. Among these, the rivalry between India and Pakistan has been one of the most enduring and complex, marked by historical conflicts, a shared border, and the possession of nuclear arsenals. This volatile relationship has taken on a new and challenging dimension with the emergence of fifth-generation warfare—a form of conflict that transcends traditional boundaries and defies conventional definitions of war. India, as a dominant regional power, has increasingly leveraged the unconventional tactics of fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan, prompting a comprehensive examination of the dynamics at play (Butt, 2021).

Fifth-generation warfare, often abbreviated as 5GW, represents a shift in the character of conflict. It introduces a host of non-traditional elements, including cyber warfare, information warfare, disinformation campaigns, and hybrid strategies that are deployed in an integrated and coordinated manner. These tactics, driven by advances in technology and the interconnected nature of the digital age, challenge traditional understandings of war and peace, rendering physical borders less relevant in the face of cyberattacks and information manipulation. The consequence is a form of warfare that extends well beyond the battlefield, infiltrating every facet of society and governance (Husain et al., 2022).

For Pakistan, the advent of fifth-generation warfare poses an array of multifaceted challenges, impacting its security, stability, and foreign policy decisions (Bibi & Meer, 2023). This modern battlefield operates within the digital realm, where the fog of war is often comprised of disinformation, malware, and shadowy proxies (Khan, 2019). Understanding and effectively countering these evolving threats have become paramount objectives for Pakistan's national security apparatus. As such, this research embarks on a journey to dissect and analyze India's employment of fifth-generation warfare tactics against Pakistan and to evaluate Pakistan's counter-strategies (Jahangir & Bashir, 2022).

The rationale for this research is grounded in the pressing need to comprehend the evolving threat landscape and to formulate strategies that enable Pakistan to safeguard its national interests. India's use of fifth-generation warfare tactics, including cyberattacks, information warfare, disinformation campaigns, and subversion through proxies, poses a direct challenge to Pakistan's security. These tactics aim to weaken the fabric of society, undermine governance, and erode trust in national institutions (Askari & Niazi, 2022).

This study holds significance not only within academic discourse but also within the real-world context of national security. It addresses a critical gap in existing literature by zeroing in on the specific dynamics of India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan. Through meticulous research and analysis, it seeks to equip policymakers, strategists, and security practitioners with a deeper understanding of the evolving threats and challenges faced by Pakistan (Nadeem et al., 2021).

To address the objectives of this research, this research will pose several key questions. These include inquiries into the nature of India's tactics, the strengths and weaknesses of

Pakistan's counter-strategies, and potential measures to strengthen Pakistan's security in the era of fifth-generation warfare.

As we embark on this research journey, it is important to recognize the ever-evolving nature of conflict and the imperative to adapt to new challenges. This study's findings aim to contribute not only to our theoretical understanding of contemporary security but also to the practical ability of Pakistan to develop effective and informed responses to the complex, dynamic, and multifaceted threat that is fifth-generation warfare (Jahangir & Bashir, 2022).

1.2. Statement of the Problem

The escalating dynamics of the India-Pakistan relationship, characterized by 5th generation warfare tactics imposed by India, present multifaceted and complex challenges to regional security and stability. This unusual form of warfare, cyber-attacks, disinformation campaigns, economic pressure, and psychological operations, aims to undermine societal cohesion, political stability, and economic progress in Pakistan without engaging in traditional military conflict. The problem at the heart of this research is India's use of fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan. 5th generation warfare, its non-traditional combat methods, including propaganda, cyber warfare and psychological operations, requires a refined understanding of asymmetric conflict dynamics. These tactics pose a serious challenge to Pakistan's security, stability, and foreign policy decisions. Moreover, the concern at the core of this research is to analyze India's utilization of fifth-generation warfare tactics against Pakistan and evaluate the effectiveness of Pakistan's counter-strategies in response to this unconventional form of conflict. Therefore, it is imperative to understand the evolving dimensions of this warfare and evaluate Pakistan's strategies for

responding effectively. The research also aims to provide a comprehensive evaluation and understanding the contemporary conflict resolutions mechanisms and geopolitical strategies.

1.3. Significance of the Study

This study is of utmost significance as it addresses a crucial gap in the existing literature by focusing on the specific context of India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan. By shedding light on this complex issue, the research will contribute to Pakistan's ability to formulate more robust and informed strategies in response to these evolving threats.

The significance of the research on fifth generation warfare of India against Pakistan and the counter strategies of Pakistan is multifaceted. First, it is an important topic to be studied to understand the evolving threat of fifth generation warfare. It represents the important shift international conflicts which are now moving from traditional military engagements to the advanced tactics such as asymmetric operations, information warfare, and cyber-attack. It is important to understand the phenomenon of 5GW to comprehend the changing nature of the modern world conflicts (Masehullah et al., 2023). Another significance of the research is to better assess the impact of 5GW on the national security of Pakistan. There is no denying the fact India's strategy to use different fifth generation warfare tactics against Pakistan is posing substantial challenges to the national security of Pakistan such as it is leading towards social unrest, sectarian division, ethnic division, and challenges to the national reconciliation (Ashraf et al., 2021). The research about the response of Pakistan and the strategies to deal with these issues in order to protect state security is significant. The research is also important to evaluate the effectiveness of the counter strategies employed by the Pakistan against Indian tactics of fifth generation warfare. This research will help the reader to understand the Pakistan's efforts in

combating the 5GW including strengthening cybersecurity and improving the information resilience that leads to national integrity and cohesion as well as provides the insights of the decisions taken by the institutions and highlight major policies in this regard. In addition to this, the research is important in informing the security dynamics on both regional and global level. It is because the interplay between the 5th generation warfare tactics of India and the counter strategies of Pakistan will impact both the original stability as well as the geopolitical dynamics globally. The better understanding of these dynamics can play a significant role in informing the legislatures to cooperate at global and regional level for better policies. Moreover, the research is significant because it will contribute in the existing literature as well as understanding the growing and evolving nature of advanced warfare with the challenges that are posed by generation warfare. It will be helpful to develop appropriate mechanism of response against such tactics. Therefore, the research is already spent in form for both theoretical as well as the practical applications in the security study field and resolving the conflicts between the countries. Furthermore, the in-depth research on the topic will support the institutions of Pakistan to identify the vulnerabilities and further research for the better and robust strategies to counter 5GW with improved resilience and secure its national interests.

1.4. Rationale of the Study

The rationale for this study is driven by the urgent need to understand the evolving threat posed by India's fifth-generation warfare and how Pakistan is adapting to confront these challenges. The study aims to assess the vulnerabilities of Pakistan in the face of these tactics, as well as the effectiveness of its countermeasures. This research is vital to enhancing Pakistan's national security posture.

It aims to highlight the non-kinetic strategies used by India against Pakistan such as cyber-attacks, disinformation campaigns, and employment of proxy militants to threaten the Pakistan's national image and security (Durrani, 2024). The study seeks to offer the academia, policy makers, as well as all the relevant institutions and stakeholders with comprehensive analysis of complex issues related to fifth generation warfare and support these stakeholders in designing reliable policies and make informed decisions to protect the national interests of Pakistan. It is because without understating the evolving nature of conflicts and the advanced methods, the safeguard of the national interests is not possible (Abrar, 2024).

1.5. Objectives of the Study

The primary objectives of this research are as follows:

1. To analyze the various dimensions of India's fifth-generation warfare tactics against Pakistan.
2. To analyze Pakistan's strategic responses to India's fifth-generation warfare tactics.
3. To assess the effectiveness of Pakistan's counter strategies in response to these tactics.

1.6. Research Questions

The research will address the following questions:

1. What are the specific tactics and strategies employed by India in fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan?
2. How is Pakistan responding to India's fifth-generation warfare?
3. How effective are Pakistan's strategies to counter India's fifth-generation warfare tactics?

1.7. Delimitation of the Study

This research will primarily focus on India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan and Pakistan's responses. It will consider a range of tactics within this warfare spectrum, such as cyberattacks, disinformation campaigns, and subversion through proxies. However, it will not delve into broader regional or international issues beyond their impact on the specific context of the India-Pakistan relationship.

1.8. Literature Review

Initially several theorists associated with the fifth generation warfare attempted to define this warfare. The prominent names in those who defined it in one way or another include Abbott, Safranski, Weeks, Herring, and Slog. For instance Slog defines the fifth generation warfare as deliberative secret manipulation of actors, institutions, networks, states, or any non-state forces to gain the objectives across combination of political, social, and economic domains. At the same time, they avoid the offensive or defensive retaliation actions of second, third, and fourth generation warfare' networks, actors, states, and institutions.

Fifth generation warfare can be considered as a battle of information as well as perception because in this kind of warfare where the violence is so discreetly dispersed that it is impossible

for the victim to be aware of the war as well as the victim is not aware if he will win or lose the war. The element of secrecy in the fifth generation warfare makes it one of the most dangerous kinds of generation in the contemporary world. This is considered as one of the most successful generation of warfare because it is difficult to identify. The 5th generation warfare is also associated with the war of morals and cultures which distorts the perceptions of the public to propagate a manipulated viewpoint related to the world affairs and political situation of the state. Contrary to the fourth generation warfare, which only employs asymmetric means including the use of non-state actors the portrayal of fourth generation warfare by Lind in cultural and moral territory is somehow seems similar to the analysis of 5th generation warfare given by Abbott which departs from the populations cultural rage as depicted in the fourth generation as well as it considers the conflicts context perception as important point for the analysis. The perception and context of 5th generation warfare combines both the rationality of the state as well as the peoples rage to form warfare's intended outcome while rendering the command of military useless (Qureshi, 2019).

The rapid increase in the technology, science, mass media, information, human rights, and democracy has changed the relationship between the countries as well as influenced the national interest of the states. The changing priorities due to the advancement in the recent time have implications for the relationships between the states on both regional and global level in terms of friendship and enmity. There is no denying the fact that advancement and technology has made it easy to have flow of information but at the same time it has made the security of the state a complex phenomenon. Due to these advancements the security complexity, interdependence, as well as the rivalry has become inevitable. The changing dynamics of this strategic environment has given a birth to a very new nature and form of war in the contemporary world where the

battlefield is broader with inter-implicative and inter-connective aspects with no limitations. The use of conventional weapons and force is no more prominent as well as there is no need to declare war or having casualties. It is a fact that in the contemporary world war there might be no casualties but the country can be paralyzed completely (Sumarno & Risman, 2020). Discussing the war highlights the importance of the defense that has significantly broader meaning. Markmur Supriyanto defines the concept of the defense as the study of managing the national strength and resources in all the periods including, peace, war, and after war. The strength is important to counter the threats that state may have from both outside and within the state including military and non-military. The challenges and threats may harm the territorial integrity, sovereignty of the state as well as the national security. Here, it is important to understand the concept of threat which is the intention or a plan to do something which is difficult, detrimental, and harm the other party. This definition of threat is given by Indonesian dictionary (KBBI). However, considering the defense the threats can also be defined as the efforts that are made through crimes as well as actions which may endanger the order and interest of other states.

The dynamics of strategic environment's development in the contemporary times have highlighted the evolution of the potential threats and the transformation in the nature of the strategic threats to the sovereignty of the state whereas considering the advancement the war patterns will also be influenced in future. However, it is a fact that the forms and patterns of the irregular warfare will be prominent but at the same time the conventional warfare technology will continue to follow suit. In the future wars, the risk of casualties among citizens will be reduced with an effective application of high accuracy weapons technology and the robotics (Montgomery & Borghard, 2021). The advancement in this technology will lead to the creation of wars based on networks with the reliance on information advantages and carrying out the warfare in cyber and

digital spaces. The impact and the consequences of this war in future will be a serious concern for the international security and the challenges include the cybercrimes because it does not consider any boundaries. Also, the biotechnology engineering is not easy to detect. The technology has been developed in the aviation sector, the nuclear weapon manufacturing, and well as controlling the unnamed flying vehicles to ensure the national defense and security. Hence, noticing the aspect of national defense, the fifth domain of the battlefield will be cyber space in addition to the air, sea, and land as battlefields. One of the prominent theorists, Barry Buzan, has stated about the concept of security in his book titled "A New Pattern of Global Security in the Twenty-First Century". He argued that security can be defined as an effort to get freedom from the potential strategic threats and states' ability to maintain the independent identity as well as the ability of communities for the same purpose in this regard. He further stated that security is states and communities efforts to maintain the functional integrity against any kind of changing forces (Buzan, 1991). The advancements in the 21st century in domain of information and communication technology several changes has emerged that has influenced the change dynamics itself and leads to more uncertainties in the world affairs. Considering these changes from the perspective of warfare, it cannot be denied that the most significant potential threat is of the cyber warfare.

The participation of India in fifth-generation warfare (5GW) against Pakistan has not only piqued the interest of academics and policymakers, but has also provided a complex and diverse problem that necessitates a deeper and more extensive examination (Hussain et al., 2023). This type of warfare differs significantly from traditional kinetic warfare in that it relies on non-traditional, non-kinetic techniques of attaining strategic objectives (Mitra, 2023). In recent years, the South Asian strategic environment has seen an increased emphasis on the information warfare

component of 5GW in India's arsenal (Tahir & Afridi, 2019). This move has been paralleled by an increase in India's information activities, which include misinformation campaigns and the weaponization of social media platforms (Poudel, 2021).

India's information warfare efforts aim to exploit existing fault lines in Pakistani society, exaggerate existing concerns, and even incite ethnic and sectarian conflicts (Nemecek, 2023). The 2019 Pulwama assault, in which a suicide bomber targeted Indian paramilitary forces in Indian-administered Kashmir, is a case in point. India quickly blamed Pakistan for the incident and conducted an airstrike on Pakistani territory, resulting in a military confrontation. However, India's media warfare strategy, which portrayed the tragedy as state-sponsored terrorism by Pakistan, had a crucial impact in moulding the crisis narrative (Nayak & Chakraborty, 2023). The episode exemplifies how 5GW methods may be used to manipulate public opinion and international views, perhaps leading to a physical confrontation (Gichki, 2022).

Another crucial component of India's 5GW strategy is cyber warfare. In recent years, India has launched more sophisticated cyberattacks against Pakistan's crucial infrastructure, political institutions, and even the military. The cyberattack on the Karachi Stock Exchange in 2020 was important, exposing India's skills and aim in this arena (Haider et al., 2020). These assaults have the potential to disrupt critical services, impair national security, and create an atmosphere of uncertainty and vulnerability (Basrur, 2019).

Pakistan has taken a diverse approach in response to the rising danger of 5GW (Nawaz et al., 2023). Improving cyber resilience has become a critical component of this approach (Linkov & Kott, 2019). It entails strengthening the nation's cybersecurity infrastructure, investing in cyber professional training, and building a strong legislative framework to confront cyber threats. Furthermore, Pakistan's military has developed a strategic communication section focused at

fighting disinformation and constructing narratives that match the country's strategic interests (Ashraf et al., 2022). Furthermore, Pakistan has attempted to broaden its foreign alliances and partnerships in order to gain assistance and cooperation in dealing with the various risks posed by 5GW (Saboor et al., 2022).

Recent geopolitical events, including as the shifting situation in Afghanistan and the changing dynamics of great power competition, have highlighted the need of Pakistan's counter-5GW policies (Upadhyay, 2023). As a result, this area has developed as a dynamic and changing field of research, with ramifications not only for the South Asian region's security and stability, but also for the larger international community (Liu & Liu, 2019).

India's fifth-generation warfare (5GW) against Pakistan presents a multifaceted challenge that calls for meticulous examination and thoughtful consideration (Rajorshi, 2023). This form of warfare marks a substantial departure from traditional kinetic warfare, introducing a complex array of strategies that transcend physical boundaries and encompass non-traditional, non-kinetic means. At the core of India's evolving approach is the significant emphasis placed on information warfare and cyber warfare, which have become increasingly sophisticated tools for achieving strategic objectives.

Information warfare, a cornerstone of India's 5GW tactics, relies on the manipulation of information to shape narratives and perceptions both domestically and internationally. Disinformation campaigns, often disseminated through social media and digital platforms, play a pivotal role in India's strategy (Fox, 2023). These campaigns exploit existing fault lines within Pakistani society, amplify grievances, and even stoke ethnic and sectarian tensions. The 2019 Pulwama attack serves as a striking illustration, where India framed the incident as an act of state-sponsored terrorism by Pakistan, ultimately shaping the narrative around the crisis and

influencing public opinion (Nayak & Chakraborty, 2023). As such, the potential of 5GW tactics to escalate tensions and potentially lead to kinetic conflicts is evident.

Cyber warfare is another critical facet of India's 5GW strategy, where Pakistan has found itself as a prime target of increasingly sophisticated cyberattacks. These attacks target Pakistan's critical infrastructure, government institutions, and even its military, underscoring the significance of this domain. The 2020 cyberattack on the Karachi Stock Exchange is a noteworthy incident, highlighting India's capabilities and intentions in the cyber domain (Naseer et al., 2020). Such cyberattacks have the potential to disrupt essential services, undermine national security, and create an environment of uncertainty and vulnerability (Basrur, 2019).

India also used 15-year covert operation which is aimed to impress EU and UN to benefit Indian interests, which was revealed in EU DisinfoLab. More than 750 media outlets globally creating fake identities, propagandas and cyber threats against Pakistan. These fake media houses exposed in EU DisinfoLab undermine primarily Pakistan by spreading disinformation and manipulating perceptions.

In response to the evolving threat of fifth-generation warfare (5GW), Pakistan has implemented a comprehensive and multifaceted strategy aimed at enhancing its resilience in the cyber domain. This strategic response is rooted in a clear recognition of the need to fortify the nation's defenses against the evolving nature of warfare in the digital age. The multifaceted approach encompasses several key elements: Pakistan has prioritized the strengthening of its national cybersecurity infrastructure. This involves the development and implementation of advanced technologies, protocols, and practices to protect critical digital assets, networks, and systems from cyber threats. These efforts are designed to bolster the nation's overall cyber defences and minimize vulnerabilities that could be exploited by adversaries. Recognizing the

importance of human capital in cybersecurity, Pakistan has invested in the training and development of cyber professionals. This includes both government personnel and private-sector experts who are equipped with the skills and knowledge required to effectively defend against cyber threats. This investment in human resources contributes to the overall cyber resilience of the nation (Maaz, 2018).

Pakistan has also focused on establishing a robust legal framework to address cyber threats. This involves the enactment of laws and regulations that define cybercrimes, prescribe penalties for offenders, and provide the legal basis for investigating and prosecuting cybercriminals. A well-defined legal framework is essential for deterring malicious cyber activities and ensuring accountability. Recognizing the significant role of information warfare and disinformation campaigns in 5GW, Pakistan has established a dedicated strategic communication division within its military. This division is tasked with countering disinformation and crafting narratives that align with Pakistan's strategic interests. By effectively managing the information domain, Pakistan aims to mitigate the impact of false narratives and maintain a favorable image on the global stage (Khan et al., 2023).

Pakistan has pursued a proactive approach in diversifying its international alliances and partnerships. This diplomatic strategy seeks to garner support and cooperation from various countries and international organizations in addressing the multifaceted threats posed by 5GW. By building collaborative relationships, Pakistan aims to collectively confront the challenges posed by this evolving form of warfare. In sum, Pakistan's response to the evolving threat of 5GW is characterized by a holistic and proactive approach that spans multiple dimensions of cybersecurity, legal preparedness, information management, and international cooperation. These

measures collectively contribute to Pakistan's efforts to enhance its cyber resilience and effectively counter the multifaceted challenges presented by 5GW (Nadeem et al., 2021).

The dynamic nature of the 5GW conflict arena necessitates ongoing study and analysis to effectively confront the numerous dangers it poses (Nawaz et al., 2023). Recent geopolitical developments, including the evolving situation in Afghanistan and shifting dynamics in great power competition, further underscore the significance of Pakistan's strategies to counter India's 5GW tactics. This evolving domain has not only regional but also global implications, making it imperative to delve into its complexities for a comprehensive understanding of the multifaceted challenges and the formulation of effective counterstrategies.

1.9. Research Gap

There is very minimal research available in the existing literature that focuses on the fifth generation warfare in context of Pakistan and India. However, the academic publications usually focus on hybrid warfare in general or in context of different countries but not really specific to Pakistan and India. This research is mainly focused on Indian waged fifth generation warfare against Pakistan and it will be an addition to the existing literature.

1.10. Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework of Hybrid Warfare Theory is a central concept in understanding the dynamics of contemporary conflicts, especially in the context of India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan and Pakistan's counter-strategies. Hybrid Warfare Theory recognizes the changing nature of warfare, where traditional boundaries between war and peace, military and non-military activities, are increasingly blurred. This theory provides a solid foundation for

comprehending the multifaceted challenges posed by India's tactics and Pakistan's responses in the evolving conflict landscape.

The term hybrid warfare is referred to multiplicity as well as the subsequent mixture of all the instruments available for the power and bound to create confusion. Over the past several years the term hybrid warfare has been blotted a lot and it has moved from a military concept to the broader elements of statecraft including the competition, information campaigns as well as sabotage which either fall within the aspect of war or do not fall the war realm (VAN DER VENNE, 2021). However, the debate over the term and scope of hybrid warfare remained an important topic in the past; however, since 2000s the leading theorist of hybrid warfare Frank Hoffman expanded the hybrid warfare vision as a military concept. However, in the comprehensive series of significant and influential articles, he stresses on the conflicts and their nature in 21st century characterizing them as having convergence modes of conflicts. It means a compression of all methods and levels of war that may include different intensity levels with irregular tactics and the conventional capabilities. He also highlighted the different types of actors in these conflicts and wars in 21st century. To him, hybrid warfare is a blend and fuss of the full range of modes and methods of conflict into single warfare. It means that the adversaries can be using the conventional methods and can switch anytime to the irregular or guerrilla warfare. The historical precedent of mixing of conventional and unconventional methods in warfare is present but the hybrid warfare explained by Hoffman is different from the old theories such as 4th generation warfare (Hoffman, 2014). He describes the hybrid warfare considering the tactical and operational integration of different modes of conflict through the high-technology exploitation as well as the information aspect. However, the scope of hybrid warfare expanded with the Russian actions in 2014 in Ukraine. The IISS military balance 2015 explained the hybrid warfare after

Russian actions as the use of both military tools and non-military tools in integrated campaigns. In these campaigns, the aim is to achieve surprise, seize the initiative as well as get the psychological and physical benefits by using different diplomatic means. Also, it includes the cyber and electronic operations, rapid information, covert and overt intelligence actions as well as the economic pressure.

Considering hybrid warfare as a concept differentiates it in two discourses. In the first, the focus is hybridity in military domain whereas the second deals with the hybridity in the threat environment. The first discourse is all about the tactical and operational choices in battle-space. Besides, it is characterized by convergence of several modes of conflicts. However, it is increased with the use of high tech weaponry. One of the significant examples observed in recent times include the Hezbollah in 2006 and the way it was involved in the second Lebanese war where the group used mixture of conventional and the guerrilla tactics in urban environment and exploited the sophisticated weaponry (Renz, 2019). It is highlighted that the non-state actor does not only fused the militia forces effectively but also had the highly trained fighters' with antitank guided teams for missile in the war. Therefore, the military dimension of hybrid warfare includes the parameter that the war occurs within the battle-space place as well as involves the harmonization and convergence of the following:

1. Conventional methods: It includes the conventional tactics and formations as well as the organizations.
2. Irregular methods: It includes irregular tactics, organizations, and formations. The prominent examples are terrorism, proxy warfare, guerrilla, and indiscriminate violence.
3. Different actors' types: It varies between irregular, traditional, disruptive, and catastrophic dimensions and it may include both state actors and non-state actors.

4. High tech and advanced weaponry: It includes advanced conventional weapons, cyber tools, as well as the network technology.

On the other hand, the second discourse expands the notion of warfare from the battle space to the global threat environment in which several actors will be involved exploiting all the means and instruments of power to achieve particular goals. In this way, the warfare takes place within the global threat environment and it involves the harmonization and convergence of military means, diplomatic means, economic means, cyber tools, and propaganda (Seely, 2017). In the military means, it may include both the conventional methods and irregular methods whereas in diplomatic means international law and other treaties can be used to exert the influence. Also, the economic pressure can be exerted on the other states through sanctions, barriers to access the market as well as disrupting the economic and commercial activities of the competitors. Besides, the cyber tools usually include manipulation, sabotage, espionage, and the influence with attacking the other state whereas the disinformation campaigns and the fake news is circulate online which comes under the propaganda against the state to harm its international position. To analyze the case of India and Pakistan under the theoretical framework of hybrid warfare, it is important to understand the character of hybrid warfare and its operational aspects.

Considering the character of hybrid warfare, it is a kind of grand strategy and an irregular warfare. The grand strategy aspect refers to the use of all instruments of the state power to achieve the objectives of the state including social, economic, military, diplomatic, and informational measures (Strachan, 2019). The major thinkers of consider hybrid warfare as grand strategy include Julian Corbett, Colin Gray, Basil, Fuller, and Liddell Hart. Similarly, the aspect of irregular warfare is a struggle that can be violent between state and non-state actors focusing on influence and legitimacy. It is usually people-centric, amorphic, and asymmetric (Gray, 2016).

The key thinkers who consider hybrid warfare irregular include Sun Tzu, Thucydides, and Mao. On the other hand, the operational aspect of the hybrid warfare theory includes information warfare and OODA Loop. By OODA means observe, orient, decide, and act. It is a decision making model which considers enemy as complex adaptive system and the decision is made in the battle ground using time as strategic factor. However, the major thinkers in this operational aspect of the hybrid warfare include John Boyd and Frans Osinga (VAN DER VENNE, 2021).

In the context of the research topic, Hybrid Warfare Theory serves as a critical lens through which to analyze India's fifth-generation warfare. Here's how it links to the topic:

- 1. Blurring of Traditional Boundaries:** Hybrid warfare blurs the lines between traditional forms of warfare and other instruments of state power. India's fifth-generation warfare tactics incorporate a mix of military and non-military means, such as cyberattacks, information warfare, and proxy elements. These tactics challenge conventional definitions of war and peace and require a broader understanding of conflict.
- 2. Comprehensive Approach:** Hybrid warfare involves the simultaneous use of a range of tools and tactics, including cyber warfare, propaganda, irregular warfare, and proxy warfare. India's approach against Pakistan includes not only cyberattacks but also disinformation campaigns and the use of proxy elements to achieve strategic objectives. Understanding this multifaceted approach is crucial in comprehending the full scope of the conflict.
- 3. Complex Interplay of Tactics:** Hybrid warfare theory highlights the complex interplay of different tactics and strategies. In the case of fifth-generation warfare, this complexity is evident in India's ability to use cyberattacks to disrupt critical infrastructure while

simultaneously conducting information warfare to manipulate public perception. This complex interplay creates a challenging environment for Pakistan's responses.

- 4. Non-Attribution and Deniability:** Hybrid warfare often involves tactics that allow the aggressor to maintain a degree of plausible deniability. In India's fifth-generation warfare, cyberattacks and disinformation campaigns can be executed in ways that make attribution difficult. This adds an element of ambiguity to the conflict, making it harder for Pakistan to respond definitively.
- 5. Impact on National Resilience:** Hybrid warfare theory emphasizes the importance of national resilience, which is a state's ability to withstand and recover from security threats. In the context of fifth-generation warfare, the impact on Pakistan's national resilience is significant. The multifaceted nature of the conflict challenges Pakistan's ability to absorb and recover from shocks, whether in terms of cyberattacks, information warfare, or societal disruption.

By applying Hybrid Warfare Theory to the research, it allows for a more nuanced understanding of India's tactics in the fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan. It underscores the need to look beyond conventional military actions and consider the broader range of tactics that fall under the umbrella of hybrid warfare. This framework helps researchers and policymakers alike to appreciate the complex interplay of factors in this evolving security landscape, ultimately contributing to more informed responses and strategies for Pakistan to safeguard its national interests and security.

1.11. Research Methodology

1.11.1. Research Design

There are three methods to conduct effective research and all three research methods have been used to come up with rational outcomes. Firstly, the qualitative research method has been adopted in which several methods are employed in order to develop better understanding about people's perceptions of social realities and their consequences & the way people react in social setting. However, in this method, there are several ways to collect the data including interviews, direct observations, official documents, cultural records, and personal experiences. However, it also includes the analysis of arti-craft and cultural records. Besides, the most effective way to conduct the research and collect qualitative data is unstructured interviews that allow the respondent to answer the open-ended questions with his deep understanding. In qualitative data, text, words, photographs, sound recordings, and videos are considered as empirical data (Bryman et al., 2021). For the interpretation of data, several methods can be used such as content analysis, thematic or discourse analysis, and also grounded theories.

The qualitative methods are usually based on the inductive logic because researcher preferably generates the theoretical proposition out of the empirical observations. It usually contains non-numeric data for both collection and analysis and the researcher may use different strategies for the collection of data such as internet-based research, interviews, archival, focus groups, and document-based research strategy. It also includes non-textual forms of work including maps, social artifacts, monuments, and art. Besides, there are several tools for qualitative data analysis such as content and discourse analysis.

Quantitative research methods refer to the collection and analysis of data where data is found in numeric that help to determine the relationship between two or more than two variables.

The research can be done by predicting the value of one variable based on another known variable. It includes both statistical analysis and formal modeling (Johnson et al., 2007). However, there are many advantages of using the quantitative research method because this method includes aggregation, specificity, transparency, causal inference, and easy theory and hypothesis testing. The data of a large population can be collected through different techniques such as surveys and questionnaires.

In the quantitative research method, the researcher gathers the data in numerical form that can easily put in the rank order or different categories as well as it can be measured in measurement units. However, this type of data can help to make graphs and tables for better understanding. The method can be used to test a theory and results in supporting or rejecting the existing theory. For the collecting of data, one can rely on the experiments and questionnaire surveys. Quantitative data plays a significant role in decision making and the statistics help in summarizing the data, describing patterns, connections, and relationships. However, the statistics that have been found can be descriptive or inferential.

The third and final method to conduct research is a mixed research method that is a mixture of both the above-mentioned methods such as the quantitative and qualitative research method. The mixed research method has been recognized increasingly by many researchers and it is considered as the third pillar of both types of methodologies. It rejects the rigid ideas of quantitative and qualitative methods of research and contains mutually exclusive assumptions about how to understand the world. The innovative mixed research method challenges the assumed boundaries of qualitative and quantitative research methods as well as empiricism and interpretivism (McLeod, 2023).

The research methodology for the study on India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan and Pakistan's counter-strategies encompasses a multi-faceted approach, including qualitative method. This approach is designed to provide a comprehensive understanding of the subject matter, from the tactics employed by India to the effectiveness of Pakistan's counter-strategies.

The research will involve the following steps:

1.11.2. Population

Primary data will be collected from the experts and Official government documents; including Inflectional figures related to Indian and Pakistani defense and political sectors, press releases, and policy statements on fifth generation warfare strategies.

1.11.3. Sampling

There are only few experts on fifth generation warfare, therefore, snow ball sampling technique will be utilized.

1.11.4. Instrumentation

Open ended questionnaires will be created to conduct unstructured interviews from the experts and professionals of the fifth generation warfare strategies.

1.11.5. Data Collection

A variety of sources will be used to gather information for analysis in order to guarantee a thorough comprehension of the subject. This will consist of: Disinfo Lab, Press releases, policy statements, and white papers on defense, reports from worldwide media sources as well as news sources in Pakistan and India. This research will place a significant importance on information gathered from the Disinfo Lab, a renowned organization specializing in the analysis of

disinformation campaigns and digital propaganda. The data will also be collected from public remarks, addresses, and proclamations made by political and military figures. Moreover, information will be collected from social media posts and tweets from prominent personalities and official accounts pertaining to the political and military domains in Pakistan and India.

1.11.6. Data Analysis

The collected data will be organized for thematic analysis and a thematic map of the analysis will be generated. Each pattern or theme will be analyzed in relation to the research questions to determine how they contribute to understanding the tactics and strategies of India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan, and the counter-strategies of Pakistan.

Operational Definition of Major Terms

- **Fifth-Generation Warfare:** Refers to non-traditional forms of warfare that involve cyberattacks, information warfare, disinformation campaigns, and hybrid strategies.
- **India's Fifth-Generation Warfare:** India's fifth-generation warfare refers to the coordinated use of tactics and strategies by the Indian state, such as cyberattacks, information manipulation, disinformation campaigns, and hybrid approaches, to undermine Pakistan's security, stability, and governance.
- **Counter-Strategies:** Denotes the measures and tactics employed by Pakistan to counter and mitigate the effects of India's fifth-generation warfare.
- **Pakistan's Counter-Strategies:** Pakistan's counter-strategies comprise the measures, policies, and actions adopted by the Pakistani government and its security apparatus to detect, mitigate, and respond to the threats posed by India's fifth-generation warfare. These

strategies may include enhancing cybersecurity, countering disinformation, bolstering national resilience, and adapting diplomatic and military responses.

- **Cyber Warfare:** Cyber warfare involves the use of digital technologies, such as hacking, malware deployment, and other cyber operations, for offensive or defensive purposes in the context of conflict. It encompasses state-sponsored or state-supported cyberattacks targeting critical infrastructure, information systems, and communication networks.
- **Cyber Deterrence:** A strategy aimed at deterring cyberattacks by maintaining the capability to respond effectively.
- **Information Warfare:** Information warfare refers to the manipulation and dissemination of information to influence public perception, shape narratives, and achieve strategic objectives. It includes tactics such as propaganda, psychological operations, and media manipulation, both in traditional and digital communication channels.
- **Disinformation Campaigns:** Disinformation campaigns involve the systematic spread of false or misleading information with the intention to deceive, confuse, or undermine the credibility and stability of a target. These campaigns are often coordinated and may use various communication channels, including social media and online platforms.
- **Hybrid Strategies:** Hybrid strategies encompass the integration of conventional military actions, irregular warfare, cyber operations, and information warfare to achieve political and strategic goals. These strategies blend various tactics to exploit vulnerabilities and create ambiguity in the adversary's response.
- **Proxy Elements:** Proxy elements refer to non-state actors or groups employed by a state to carry out covert or deniable actions on its behalf. In the context of fifth-generation

warfare, these proxies may include militant groups, cyber mercenaries, or actors engaged in information warfare who advance the objectives of a sponsoring state.

This research proposal outlines a comprehensive plan to study India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan and Pakistan's counter-strategies. The research seeks to provide valuable insights into the evolving security dynamics in South Asia and contribute to enhancing Pakistan's national security posture.

1.12. Organization of the Study

Chapter 1

Chapter 1 includes the introduction, background of the study, literature review of different books, journals, articles, theoretical framework and research methodology.

Chapter 2

1. Tactics and strategies employed by India in fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan.

This chapter discuss the tactics and strategies employed by India in fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan.

2. Pakistan responding to India's fifth-generation warfare

This part of the second chapter discusses Pakistan's respond to India 5th generation warfare.

Chapter 3

Chapter three explores the strategies as well as their effects to counter India's fifth-generation warfare against Pakistan.

Chapter 4

Conclusion

Finally, in this chapter research outline has been discussed highlighting the research questions, objectives of research, research methodology and theoretical framework. The importance of research has also discussed with its limitations as well. However, to find the research gap, a detailed analysis of existing literature is done and the comparison of different literature work made it possible to find the research gap that needs to be addressed in this research. The next chapter will discuss the Indian hybrid warfare strategy against Pakistan and all the tactics of India will be discussed comprehensively. Besides, the effects of these strategies will be discussed on the national integration of Pakistan. Furthermore, the chapter aims to evaluate the responsiveness and the effectiveness of the response of Pakistan against these warfare tactics.

CHAPTER 2

INDIAN'S HYBRID WARFARE STRATEGIES AGAINST PAKISTAN

There can be multiple hybrid warfare strategies that can be observed in the contemporary world used by India against Pakistan. The main strategies will be discussed under three categories that include bringing political instability, economic slowdown, and organizing international defamation efforts against Pakistan to isolate it on international level.

2.1. Bringing Political Instability

Historically, the British Indian partition in 1947 began a complex and strained relationships between India and Pakistan. Considering the realist viewpoint a stable and strong Pakistan can be considered as a challenge to the Indian leadership role and hegemonic design in the region. In the similar vein Pakistan has also been in the security dilemma due to the Indian rise in the region. There is no denying the fact that the weak institutional framework and leadership in Pakistan has assisted India to instigate the desires of separatism in East Pakistan that end up in the fall of Dhaka in 1971. The national setback to Pakistan was also followed by another security threat by India in 1974 when India tested its nuclear weapons and in response Pakistan utilized all of its resources to acquire the nuclear weapons and in 1998 it succeeded in this mission. These problems complicated more the hostile relationships between India and Pakistan. However against the backdrop by the Pakistan's successful nuclear weapon acquisition India introduced its Cold Start Doctrine which was countered by Pakistan with its full spectrum deterrence. Due to the fear of nuclear conflict escalation India started hybrid warfare against

Pakistan and use different tactics to destabilize the country. The loopholes in the institutional frameworks in Pakistan provide all the chances to India and other States to work against the state.

Pakistan has diverse population in terms of ethnicity sects and religions. The weak institutions, political instability, division of ethnicity, and poor governance mechanism in Pakistan are exacerbating the fault lines. India is putting a lot of efforts to bring instability in Pakistan and destabilize its political structure and one of the significant and prominent manifestations of these efforts include Agartala conspiracy. Between the leaders of Awami League a conspiracy was arranged in which the Indian armed forces and research and analysis wing RAW who were involved in achieving their explicit goal of destabilizing East Pakistan and making it a separate state from Pakistan. The deputy speaker of Bangladesh parliament named Shawkat Ali has also admitted during a response to the question in 2010 and 2011 about this conspiracy and revealed that the charges of conspirator was accurate against them (bdnews24.com, 2011). In addition to this, he visited Bangladesh in June 2015 the prime minister of India also confirmed that they were involved in the movement of Mukti Bahini which was ended up in partition of Pakistan and the Bangladesh creation (*Indian Forces Fought along Mukti Bahini: Modi, 2015*).

The efforts of India were not ended after the separation of East Pakistan but it continued by sponsoring the terrorism against Balochistan using the soil of Afghanistan. India has significant support with Baloch dissidents who are living in different countries to support the separation of Balochistan from Pakistan. It has also been confirmed publicly by the chief minister of Balochistan that BLA leadership has significant contacts with the different agencies of India as well as in July 2019 and article was published in the Hindu which confirmed the involvement of India with BLA (Bhattacharjee, 2019). It has been confirmed that the Balochistan Liberation Army's commanders sought medical treatment in Indian hospitals and many times they were

caught having the fake identities. In addition to this, the retired army chief of India named Vijay Kumar has also confirmed and admitted the involvement and sponsorship of India against Pakistan as well as its involvement in providing financial support to separatist elements in Balochistan (Abbasi, 2020).

Similarly the active service Indian Navy officer Kalbhushan Jadhav was arrested in Balochistan on March 3, 2016 who was accused of carrying out several espionage activities against Pakistan. He has also admitted about all these activities and revealed that he was directed for various activities in Karachi and Balochistan at the behest of RAW as well as the bad law and order condition in Karachi. In his interview he has also confirmed that RAW was involved in the separatist movements within Pakistan as well as in the region as a whole (“WHO IS KULBHUSHAN JADHAV,” n.d.).

The MQM leadership in Pakistan has also been found having ties with Indian establishment and in several official recorded interviews it has been admitted that the political party was using the Indian funds as well as the travel of Kalbhushan Yadav many times and having meetings with people related to terrorist activities confirm the Indian involvement in destabilizing the political structure of Pakistan. Many MQM leaders have also been arrested and the subsequent restoration of peace in the city ensures that the party was involved in Indian sponsored activities against Pakistan (Bennett-Jones, 2015).

The foreign office of Pakistan and the senior leadership of Pakistan’s military has confirmed multiple times about the Indian involvement in training camps in Afghanistan to plot terrorist activities in Pakistan for its destabilization. Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan has also been found having links with Indian establishment and one of the senior commanders of TTP named Ehsanullah Ehsan has also admitted in video released by Pakistan’s military that TTP is getting

funds from the RAW and NDS of Afghanistan. US Defence Secretary nominee Senator Chuck Hagel has also **suggested that India has over the years “financed problems for Pakistan on that side of the border** (Hassan, 2017).

2.2. Economic Slowdown

Considering the economic situation of Pakistan, India has made several efforts of hybrid warfare against Pakistan to undermine the economic foundation of the country even more. It is because a crippled economy impacts all aspects of the society and makes a state vulnerable to traditional and non-traditional threats in the contemporary world. First India has considered the CPEC and the other board as unnecessary competition as well as an obstacle when it comes to Indian Chabahar port (Ahmed, 2016). In response to the CPEC, the grand prime minister of India not only criticized it but also said that it is unacceptable to India and after that he traveled to Iran in May 2016 where he announced developing Chabahar Port in Southeastern India for which he committed to invest \$500 million for better trade with Iran Afghanistan and Central Asian republics. It is important to understand why CPEC has become a threat for India and therefore it is because it will outshine the projects of Chabahar which is only 75 km apart from Gwadar port. India has been engaged to create a crisis perception about CPEC through online platforms such as Facebook, YouTube, Weblinks, and Twitter (Azam, 2021).

In addition to this, during the discussion related to status of Pakistan at financial action task force in October 2020 the Indian campaigns has demonstrated the negative trends involving CPEC and Link Pakistan with instability civil turmoil and terrorism. In response to these negative trends Pakistan telecommunication authority has reported to the official authorities of Twitter about the anti-state tweets against Pakistan. Besides, different cloned think tanks have also tried to

propagate these projects as a debt trap for Pakistan especially from the Brussels and New York and they linked these projects as the modern version of East India Company and new colonialism of China in Pakistan.

Besides, the takeover of Taliban of Afghanistan India has disseminated the narrative against Pakistan that Pakistan state is involved in supporting the Taliban's to create a negative global perception so that the country may suffer from the economic sanctions. However, it has been indicated by the comprehensive analysis of English press that in the first six years after the invasion of United States into Afghanistan the Taliban were a major security concern for Pakistan due to which Pakistan has always given a negative and sometimes neutral portrait on this issue. Also, the country has suffered from a huge terrorism wave and loss of 80,000 casualties with serious economic damages to the country (Kausar et al., 2021).

Moreover, India has also advocated at FATF to ensure that Pakistan got sanctions by adding its name in the Black List of FATF. This move was launched on the basis of the allegations by India that Pakistan is supporting several groups posing threat to India such as Jaish-e-Mohammed. Moreover, after the Pulwama attack in 2019, Indian secret agencies started cyber assault against Pakistan with an aim to target its military, government assets, and commercial assets. In these attacks it has been observed that the Foreign office of Pakistan and the Pakistan's army websites were targeted the most among all other targets (Achakzai, 2019).

2.3. International Defamation Efforts against Pakistan

In the contemporary world media has become one of the significant tool to foster the digital warfare and considering the 5th generation warfare between India and Pakistan India is utilizing these tools to target the minds of the people and their perceptions emotions and thoughts.

These tools have significant influence to manipulate the public opinion through advertisement news talk shows productions and other such programs. India is manipulating these tools to portray and negative perception of governance of Pakistan as well as the law and order situation in the country with degrading economic situation. Particularly the film industry has adopted a narrative in several movies to foster animosity against Pakistan. After the incident of 9/11 it has been observed that Bollywood has done a lot of works in which they have portrait Muslims as promoters and supporters of terrorism and the insurgences in Kashmir India and other parts of the world (Bajwa, 2018). Some of the prominent examples of these films include Raees, Ek Tha Tiger, Tere Bin Laden, and Mission Majnu. In past 3 years it has been observed that India is sponsoring a lot of content that is contributing to promote negative themes against Pakistan such as the federal and provincial tensions disable military discord minority treatments in Pakistan rise of nationalism as well as the policy for Kashmir. In addition to this the sponsored contents also include the negative perception related to women and children rights in Pakistan and the CPEC projects. The Express Tribune has compiled all of these sponsored content and analyzed that the spread of such disinformation against Pakistan has played a serious role in the meetings of FATF. There are multiple Twitter accounts that has also complained by the state authorities of Pakistan to the official Twitter authorities that are originating from India and disseminate the content related to terrorism security terrorism forced conversions and peace issues in Pakistan. In 2019 and 2020, an EU based NGO 'DisInfo Lab' has also exposed the negativity of India against Pakistan and revealed several Indian disinformation campaigns. These campaigns included fake news and engaged in the activities to get international and civil society support against Pakistan. The two significant groups who were found involve in this disinformation against Pakistan are ANI (Indian Press Agency) and Shrivastava group and later has been revealed that most of the information

provided by these groups was either fake and inaccurate or misleading (Alexandre Alaphilippe et al., 2020)

The investigation has held in which it has been revealed that ANI and other networks with more than 250 websites worth spreading miss information against Pakistan since 2005 across more than 60 countries worldwide. It is not the only issue that has been highlighted but also several united nation and your linked humanitarian groups and social organizations have collected this information. Most prominent leader placement of Pakistan on greatest of financial action task force in 2020 has raised the concerns about the involvement in financing extremism and the reports has identified several NGOs associated with united nation human rights council as potential involved in activities against the Pakistan that led to this concern. India has intensified and expanded the negative operations against Pakistan in which one of the prominent example can be observed during the protest in Lahore in April 2021 in the Tehreek-e-Labbaik Pakistan se several hash-tags were propagated and the Twitter trance were formulated including #CivilWarInPak (Baig, 2018).

These negative trends were persistent on Twitter and other online social media platforms for many days and portrait the Pakistan's political unrest image in more negative way. However, after the issue was settled down and the scrutiny was done on these trends it has been revealed that about 61% of these hashtags were operated from India and many fraudulent accounts of Twitter were engaged in coordinated inauthentic behavior (CIB) and they were all linked with India that were generating about 84,000 tweets, retweets, and replies using the negative hashtags against Pakistan. In addition to this, the investigation has revealed that 7 out of top 10 cities where the negative hashtags against Pakistan was trending include New Delhi, Hyderabad, Bangalore, Mumbai, Jaipur, Pune, and Lucknow (O'Brien, 2023).

In October 2020 several Indian Twitter accounts and websites were claiming civil war in Karachi Pakistan. Besides, in 2018 it has been admitted by Amit Shah who was then BJP president that India has the ability to deliver any message they want to the public whether it is sweet or sore and either the message is true or false. On September 6 20 21 the fall of Panjshir gave and other opportunity to the Indian Twitters to employ the disinformation campaign against Pakistan and on several platforms they tried to portray that Pakistan Air Force was involved in this offense. It is shown on widely viewed primetime news networks Republic TV in India as well as several segments from the video game have been broadcasted titled Arma-3 to present the involvement of Pakistan Air Force in it (Matloob et al., 2023).

Another example of this information operated by India can be seen in form of the advertisements such as 'Free Balochistan' and 'Save the Baloch People'. In 2017, the billboards and featuring this message on buses have been observed in United States and up and after 9/11 incident it has observed how Indian officials catch that movement and highlighted Pakistan as 'epicenter of terrorism' on different international and regional forums blaming Pakistan to host and glorify the people such as Osama Bin Laden, Masood Azhar, Hafiz Saeed, Lakhvi, Dawood Ibrahim, and Sajid Mir (Reporter, 2017).

India has never lost any option to defame Pakistan especially when Pakistani leadership is in abroad or any international leadership is on visit to sub-continent. In all the incidents India has tried to portray Pakistan as terrorist country and India as a victim state. Some of the prominent incidents in this regard include Chittisinghpura massacre (2000), Indian parliament attack (2001), Nadimarg slaughter (2003), Uri attack (2016), and the Pulwama attack (2019). These all events placed Pakistan in a very awkward position internationally (editor, 2019).

Moreover, India has not spared the sports in using it for the negative aims and securitized cricket to pressurize Pakistan. The Indian decision not to play in Pakistan was a strategic way to undermine the state's reputation. CID has unveiled in the report that RAW was involved in 2009 terrorist attack in Lahore on Sri Lankan cricket team. After that, India used this incident to avoid international events arranged in Pakistan saying that it would be a threat for all those visiting Pakistan for the matches or other events. India also put a ban on Pakistani players for their participation in IPL (Indian Premier League). Besides, in September 2021, the Cricket Board of New Zealand called off its tour to Pakistan just few minutes before the first one-day match commencement between New Zealand and Pakistan claiming some security concerns there. It happened after the players and their families received some fake emails highlighting that they will face a terrorist attack in Pakistan. However, these threatening emails were sent from the device located in India but the VPN was connected to change the IP address to Singapore. Also, in the recent 2021 T20 world cup, one of the excellent players of Pakistan named Hasan Ali was targeted in several campaigns. The verified accounts of Twitter owned by Ravi Ranjan and Anand Ranganathan were found linked with OpIndia.com and involved in fueling the sectarian unrest in Pakistan by spreading negative content. One of the columnist and editor at Swarajya named Ranganathan remarked that it was shocking to see how Hasan Ali, Pakistani cricket player is abused viciously by the fellow Pakistanis because of his Indian wife and he is Shia due to which he was targeted by them (Sarfraz, 2021).

2.4. Indian Fifth Generation Warfare against Baluchistan

Balochistan is one of the provinces in Pakistan that has degrading economic conditions as well as the political instability is at peak that gives an opportunity to the foreign powers to exploit the circumstances especially India. India has tried to deploy the anti-state actors and used several

tactics of cyber warfare to destabilize Balochistan. It has supported the religious and ethnic militants to create unrest in the province. According to the official reports it has been revealed that through the sleeping cells of India in Afghanistan India has conducted several covert operations in Balochistan and the on service soldier Kalbhushan Jadhav of India confirmed about these operations as well. It is also revealed by the government of the province that India has interfered in the province and exposed to the information warfare (Elsa, 2019). Based on the results of investigation against Indian Navy officer it is revealed how India was supporting the separatist movements in Balochistan whereas the Indian authorities rejected all of such claims however military court has completed the trial and announced the death sentence for this navy officer on the charges of spying. The Indian media warfare against the province was shaped by Doval Doctrine (Nadeem et al., 2021). This doctrine was presented by the national security advisor of India named Ajit Doval. The main objective behind this doctrine was to start hybrid warfare against Pakistan with the help of different tactics such as supporting the insurgences and to jeopardize China Pakistan economic corridor by spreading misinformation and propaganda using media forums. It has been claimed by the national security advisor of India that India has the potential to disturb Pakistan status quo through Balochistan and similarly India started the information warfare using all the means including print media social media and digital media and spread this information against Balochistan. This is a reason that India launched different radio services and websites in indigenous language of Balochistan to provoke local people against Pakistan (Naz, 2021). The major tool used by India against Pakistan in terms of media warfare is Baloch insurgency. India's media coverage of Balochistan by Hindustan Times, India Tv, India Today, Zee News, and India Times reveal how India is using war journalism. All of the stated media outlets cover small Baloch separatists' gatherings coverage and present Pakistan on media as a

genocide state. The only aim of this news is manipulating Baloch local people minds and creating distance between these people and the Pakistan state. Following table shows the media coverage given by the Indian media outlets regarding the Balochistan and Pakistan events nationally and internationally to present Pakistan as a threatening state (Khetran, 2017).

Media Sources	Contents/Coverage
Hindustan Times	<p>‘We are no longer alone’: Rebel Baloch leader thanks India for support</p> <p>‘Free Balochistan’, read protest banners outside UN while Pak PM Imran Khan delivers his speech</p> <p>‘India Should Help Us’: Balochistan's 'PM-in-Exile' Performs Puja At Haridwar Watch</p>
Zee News	Free Balochistan Movement stage protest before British Parliament against Pakistani atrocities
India Today	Baloch protesters come out on streets in Germany, raise slogans against Pakistan, wave Indian Tricolour
The Times of India	<p>As Pakistan gets ready for elections, why is there so much violence in Balochistan?</p> <p>Baloch nationalists protest in front of White House (Rehman, 2022).</p>
India Tv	India must extend support to our freedom struggle: Balochistan

	separatist leader Hyrbyair Marri (Exclusive)
--	--

2.5. Effects of 5th Generation Warfare on Pakistan

The attacks from India on Pakistan using the information technology tools are having serious effects for the Pakistan to maintain its integrity on international level. Despite having strategies and taking different measures to counter the 5th generation warfare tactics from India, Pakistan is facing multiple problems. Some of the prominent effects of the 5th generation war against Pakistan are discussed below:

2.5.1. Trust Deficit in State Institutions

The weapons of fifth generation warfare used by India and the hostile intelligence agencies exceeds in breaking in to the bound between state institutions of Pakistan and the general public. In addition to this, the major trust deficit can be seen with the institutions that are responsible for the security of ideological and physical boundaries of Pakistan. It is evident from the campaign observed in 2023 elections against army of Pakistan and other security agencies. In the history, there was no time when anything like campaign against army is observed in Pakistani case but this is one of the worst effects observed recently. The trust deficit has been to the level that from showering flowers to the army, it has now led to abuse the state institutions openly and without any censorship or barriers (Hafiz, 2023).

2.5.2. 5th Generation Warfare and Politics

In the fifth generation warfare the social media has become a major risk for Pakistan. There is no denying the fact that social media played a significant role in influencing the Pakistani

politics where it provides many advantages but bringing substantial threats for the domestic politics. Different campaigns have been run by India that spread misinformation and disinformation distorting the public opinion and erode their faith in the democratic institutions of Pakistan. Different platforms of social media are reinforcing the existing prejudices and creating filter bubbles that entrench differences of political parties and obstruct efforts to establish the common goal. In addition to this the political players are also found engaged in using social media platforms in breaching the privacy and cyber-attacks that jeopardize the critical information and integrity of democratic processes (Shahzad, 2021). Social media has provided one of the significant platforms to the Indian agencies to cause misinformation among Pakistani public and sow the seeds of mistrust between Pakistani institutions and general public. India has used different events to hype the fifth generation warfare against Pakistan and one of the most prominent example can be observed in form of June 29th, 2020 stock exchange attack on Pakistan. It was a prominent example of cyber warfare that has targeted the Pakistani institutions and the investigation revealed this event as planned by foreign parties to hamper the trade and expose the weaknesses in financial infrastructure of Pakistan. It has degraded the trust of Pakistani community on their democratic institutions believing how financial institution can be impacted by these cyber-attacks and lead to serious national security crisis and economic instability in the country (Shafi, 2022).

2.5.3. Weakening Religious and Social Fabric in Pakistan

In this increased fifth generation warfare the hostile agencies against Pakistan are using fake news to exploit the social diversity and manipulating the religious fabric of society negatively. It has resulted in extreme divide on both religious and the ethnic grounds. There are already ethnic divides existing in Pakistan such as Pashtoon, Baloch, Sindhi, and Punjabi that has

been fueled by the hostile agencies and led to more intolerance and refusal to peaceful coexistence. In addition to this, the sectarian hostilities have been increased to an extent that hundreds of people are killed and law is deteriorated a lot (Sami, 2024).

Moreover, India has employed the information warfare tactics at several events impacting the integrity and trust of Pakistan on national and international level. The hostile and non-state actors used the propaganda and disinformation efforts against Pakistan that led to foment divisions, swaying public opinion, and eroding their confidence in the different official institutions of the government. These techniques are used to incite the violence as well as inflaming sectarian tensions in Pakistan to undermine the legitimacy of the government (Rizvi, 2020). The false narratives are spread and it has affected the social fabric a lot. Furthermore, the deployment of proxy players and non-states actors backed by India in case of Kashmir dispute highlights major efforts of Indian agencies against Pakistan to ruin its international reputation. It has threatened Pakistan's sovereignty and security. At some stage, the risk of regional warfare was evident because the hostilities were at peak and expected that would escalate to the traditional armed combats (t'Serstevens et al., 2022).

2.5.4. Pakistan added in FATF Grey List

Financial action task force is one of the intergovernmental bodies that are working for the promotion of financial crime-fighting policies and set significant standards. The suggestions of organization have complete focus on money laundering, terror financing, and other related threats which may harm or disturb the global financial system. FATF was established in 1989 at the request of G7. However, the primary location of FATF was the Paris. With the increased globalization and interconnectedness among the financial systems of the countries, the risk of money laundering has been increased as well (The White House, 2022). The growth of trade and

global economy highlights the increasing threat of money laundering and other such crimes. However, in the present time of hybrid warfare and the fifth generation warfare, international organizations play a vital role to assert pressure to attain the political goals. Pakistan is considered as one of those countries who served as front line state against terrorism. It has sacrificed a lot to combat the negative activities to ensure the regional stability and peace. Even after Pakistan has served as frontline state against terrorism the United States has tried to put its name in a worldwide terrorist financing watch list and ignored all the sacrifices and suffering that has done by Pakistan in the battle against terrorism (*National Action Plan (NAP) to Combat Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance*, 2019). Due to this the reputation of Pakistan was damaged worldwide and India got another factor to run negative media campaigns after Pakistan was added in the gray list of financial action task force. Brigadier (R) Abdul Basit Rana has also claimed that India is trying to push with financial action task force to defame Pakistan. In any case, the efforts of India got success it directly in fact the governor and China Pakistan economic corridor transforming the destiny of Pakistan (Rizvi, 2020).

2.5.5. 5th Generation Warfare & Issues of National Integration

Pakistan has a significant geo-strategic location on the world map which creates its importance for the strong powers of the world. First considering the side of China that is one of the developed countries is in its neighbor whereas India as a permanent rival located on the other. Similarly, Afghanistan that remained a war zone and the Iran the enemy of USA also is a neighbor of Pakistan making its location imperative for the great powers. However it is important to investigate the techniques that are used by great powers and the super power to achieve its interest in this area.

Indian never wants to see Pakistan among the developed nation and always try to counter the countries development as well as damaging its soft corner and image on the international level. There are multiple anti Pakistan forces in which India is among the top and it has adopted all the possible ways to counter the development of Pakistan as well as create maximum hurdles in the developmental way of Pakistan. In this way, the anti-Pakistan forces always continue to work against the Pakistan as well as create problems related to national integration and divide the people on the basis of sect, race, social classes, and language.

Pakistan was made on the concept of federalism but the implementation was never been happen in its full spirit. Most of the time, the immaturity from the leadership weakens the position of Pakistan on international level. This is a reason that Pakistan after some years of its independence was divided into two parts and the Bangladesh was formed. However, many of the Hindus teachers played active role in promoting hatred among people and teaching Bengalis that their rights are not given by the central government. The hate literature not only did brain washing but also heightened the negative feelings for Pakistan among the masses that end up in dividing the country into two parts (Zakria, 2019).

It was the perfect time for the anti-Pakistan forces to think how they can do negative things against Pakistan as well as because Pakistan have unique geo-strategic position that make it more important for the anti-Pakistan forces and they give their best to destabilize the country to get their interest not only in the region but also within Pakistan. The 5th generation warfare techniques also started to be used by superpowers since year back but just after entering in 21st century these warfare techniques started to adopt against Pakistan to target the ideology of the country and harming its security and unity.

The anti-Pakistan forces use the tactics against Pakistan especially included young generation and target their psychological aspect and stands them against their own country and military forces. There is no denying the fact that the anti-Pakistan forces did not wage any physical attack but they did psychological attacks with help of literature and media due to which most of the Pakistani get doubt for their own forces. These anti forces does not only create the moments on the name of human rights but also highlighted several things on international media that directly target the national forces of Pakistan and showing it at a risk.

In addition to this, some of the events were created when it has been shown that Islam is a radical religion. Similarly, Pakistan has faced serious harsh time on Afghan borders and faced a lot of casualties within and outside the Pakistan. Many anti-Pakistan forces have highlighted the border between Pakistan as 'Qabal's Death' due to the policies of Pakistan as well as its participation in the war.

This kind of media news makes it easy for the people to believe who have lost their family members in any of the drone attacks. They blame Pakistan for those accidents and unrecoverable loss. The anti-Pakistan forces manipulate those people against Pakistan and train them against the security forces of the country. Those people get sympathy from the anti-forces and being manipulated to take revenge from the Pakistani authorities considering them as their enemies. The hate literature and speech through media disturbed everywhere and the manipulated news led to insurgency (Guala, 2014).

Moreover, an ex-officer of USA army accepted of using different fifth generation warfare techniques especially calling it C formula which means convinced, confuse, and conflict. He argued that the core target of the army remained getting their interest and for that they target and make plan involving the local masses of the countries. In these plans they always make sure that

they choose the people who face problems from the country as well as target the issues that are commonly faced by the majority of the people. He further argued that to implement C formula they exploit the vacuums and weaknesses of the country to target them easily and make both people and leaders to follow them so that the main group behind any agenda remain invisible. It has also found that they always target the young generation of the country because in the present time most of the young people particularly students prefer to have internet presence and in the sense of idealism concerning leaders and life it becomes easier for anti-forces to attach those people emotionally and exploit them (Sabir, 2019).

Considering the students of Pakistan in manipulating through 5th generation warfare there is no denying the fact that in Pakistan the jobs and earning resources are very less due to which most of the students remain worried about their income. Also the expense of education is high due to which students have to learn and earn at the same time. This aspect gives the anti-Pakistan forces to attack and manipulate the young generation by injecting the ideas and criticism related to governmental system of Pakistan. Through media the anti-Pakistan forces does not only inject the thoughts related to class differentiations among the young people but also they convince these students to share negative stuff about Pakistan on international platforms. This also leads to the economical war because the economic hardships of Pakistan are shared on international forums that victimize the country negatively and the problems of national integration are created through generation warfare techniques. The outcomes of these techniques can be observed in form of Pakistan's name in FATF grey list (Kamboh, 2021).

Moreover, anti-Pakistan forces have deployed their members in the society of Pakistan to manipulate the ideology and create vacuum for it. Due to this, a huge division has created in Pakistani society based on the religious sects such as Sunni, Shia, Deobundi, Brelvi, and Ahl-e-

Hadees. All the sects are following extreme values and give Fatwa on each other's sect and values. In this hate against each other, they print the hatred speech and literature that weakens the unity in the Pakistani society. It has led to several sectarian violence incidents and the Islamic values are targeted. The tragedy with Pakistan is that it has the only source of unity and national integration in name of Islam and religion but multiple causes are present contributing in its disintegration. It suffered as a victim of extremism on the basis of religious sectarianism in the society. Besides, after the Afghan war a huge religious conflict was started that not only impacted the region but deteriorated the national integration as well.

There are several religious and other divisions who claim as original and pure representative of Islam due to which the issue of *Fatwa* against each sect is prominent in the Pakistani society. Many times the bloodshed fights have been observed that hit the picture of Islam negatively on the international media. The antagonism on the basis of sectarianism has gained its peak in the Pakistani society due to which the peaceful co-existence has become a serious challenge. This fact that has not only impacted the reputation of Islam as a religion on international level but it has led a reversible effects for the Pakistan's national integration by separating turmoil and anarchy (Sial, 2011). These factors have given several opportunities to India to portray the bad picture of Islam and Pakistan permanently on international media as well as India has found investing billions of dollars in different anti-Pakistan campaigns and against the ideology of Pakistan (Malik, 2020).

Pakistan has faced extremism and terrorism in the country that has also created the security as one of the significant issue of national integration. In 1980s sectarian issue become violent after the new Iranian revolution as well as in the aftermath of Afghan war the brutality was at its peak and the religious Fatwas and the religious leaders become catalyst in the religious

warfare. There were several anti-Shia groups were operating at that time including “Sipa e Sahaba”, “Jaishe Muhammad”, “Lashkr e Jhangvi”, and “Harkatul Mujahedin”. There is no denying the fact that spiritual segregation performs a major role in sectarian violence but the political and cultural climate with economic factors lead to extreme sectarianism in the society. This is what happened in the case of Pakistan as the sectarianism in one way or another had the political motives and even the perpetrators use the spiritual ways to convince the people in their favor. History has witnessed that someday the public policy on the national level will invoke a response as well as there is strength fighting among the stakeholders. This is an excellent chance for the anti-Pakistan forces to use 5th generation warfare techniques and invest in the internet literature to destabilize and demoralize Pakistan's reputation.

In terms of terrorism, Pakistan has faced several challenges that are underscored by its high ranking in Global Terrorism Index of 2014. Pakistan has contributed its maximum efforts in countering terrorism with the global partners in the past decade but the success of Pakistan in combating terrorism remained a question for Pakistan when it comes to the Afghanistan’s ongoing sufferings as well as chaotic situation within its borders.

Following the invasion of United States in Afghanistan, the Taliban forces also moved into the borders of Pakistan that prompted Pakistan to deploy troops as well as launch several military operations against Taliban to secure the Pakistan's national security. These efforts have shown on media negatively portraying that Pakistan is supporting the Taliban forces to deteriorate its reputation on international level.

Besides, Pakistan expelled eight members in 2016 of Indian High Commission Islamabad and accused them of inciting social unrest in Pakistan as well as accused them for espionage. These individuals are alleged by Pakistan for working under the Research and Analysis Wing

(RAW) that is one of the intelligence agencies of India as well as having significant links with extremist group Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and Baloch separatist. It shows the claims of Pakistan against India of using 5th generation warfare tactics and media campaigns to destabilize Pakistan.

Pakistan has also accused India for leveraging its links with Afghanistan in order to support anti-Pakistan groups and forces. India does not only train the camps but also provide financial aid against Pakistan to these extremist elements. In this regard, the arrest of Kalbhushan Yadav served as evidence of India's utilizing 5th generation warfare tactics against Pakistan.

Major General Asif Ghafoor also emphasized on the need to consider a moderate approach towards Pashtun Tahafuz Movement, although questioning the legitimacy of the demands of PTM. He highlighted the efforts of Pakistan in order to address the concerns of the movement including clearing mines as well as addressing the problem of missing persons. At the same time, he criticized the leaders of movement including Manzoor Pashteen, Mohsin Dawar, and Ali Wazir for negative and hostile stance towards the army institution of Pakistan. He questioned about the foreign funding received by the leadership of movement and accused that they are receiving foreign funding especially from the intelligence agency of India (RAW) and alleged them for managing social media campaigns in their support from India and Afghanistan which prominently illustrates the broad tactics used against Pakistan to destabilize the country using 5th generation warfare strategy. It includes the exploitation of internal grievances among Pakistani public as well as utilizing different social media platforms to undermine the integration of the nation by manipulating the youth of Pakistan and Pashtun community. In this case, India has not only supported the PTM by the funding but also tried to harm the security and national cohesion of Pakistan by waging anti-state campaigns on media (Anis, 2019).

2.6. Pakistan's Responding to India's Fifth-generation Warfare

Pakistan's institutions are playing active role to counter the Indian threats and efforts. It is responding to the Indian's fifth generation warfare effectively. It has become important to deal with this issue because the fifth generation warfare is not a traditional warfare and not attacking the physical territories instead it is affecting the people's perceptions and minds which are more harmful in this age of globalization. Some of the significant ways used by the Pakistan are as follows:

2.6.1. Strengthening Information and Cyber Warfare Capabilities

Pakistan has taken important measures to counter the disinformation campaigns and negative narratives against the state. The military of Pakistan with the services of its intelligence agencies is working to strengthen the cyber and information warfare capabilities to observe and counter any kind of online threat efficiently. Besides, NACTA in coordination with the inter-agency efforts is playing important role to counter the social media negative narratives against Pakistan (Rafiq and Mustafa, 2021).

2.6.2. Awareness of 5th-generation Warfare & National Resilience

The authorities of Pakistan are playing significant role to raise public awareness related to the threats posed by 5th generation warfare by India against Pakistan in which it has been tried to educate the population on identifying the information online and understanding which news is fake and a propaganda. The objective behind educating and spreading awareness among public is to ensure the national unity and resilience against any negative attempt against Pakistan as well as between the public and military forces (Qureshi, 2019). The Major General Ifikhar has also gave

a positive response related to the awareness of 5th generation warfare against Pakistan and stated that the outreach weather for training or other exchanges or defense equipment is positive and he believed that the only way to handle such negative attempts against Pakistan is through transparency and not leaving the information voids and only passing the credible information. DG ISPR has also said that Pakistan is subjected to 5th generation warfare and authorities are aware of it. Major general has also stated that ‘We are well aware of this danger. We will surely succeed in winning this war with the cooperation of the nation.’

2.6.3. Diplomatic Efforts by Pakistan

The significant authorities of Pakistan are trying their best to let international powers know how Pakistan is targeted by India and how India is waging 5th generation warfare against it. By all the means, the defence forces and ISI has full capacity to counter offensive acts of India via fifth generation warfare against Pakistan. On international level, the authorities are active in presenting the evidences of Indian sponsored terrorism within Pakistan particularly in Balochistan. Army Spokesman has also stated about the Indian involvement in financing terrorism within Pakistan that, ‘The world has taken note of it. The world is talking about it, and despite India’s best efforts, there has been a lot of objective analysis of what’s been said.’ Also the military leadership of Pakistan has reached to the other leaderships of the region and received significantly positive response that benefits Pakistan in several ways. The spread of this information and diplomacy aims to get the international support and recognition of all the challenges faced by Pakistan because of employment of hybrid warfare tactics by India.

2.6.4. Economic Cohesion and Political Support

India has been involved in multiple campaigns against Pakistan to portray that Pakistan is not a safe country for investment. This is a reason that several campaigns are launched against CPEC. However, Pakistan is countering all such narratives ensuring economic cohesion in the country. On the issue of CPEC threats, the authorities significantly ensure the stakeholders Pakistan as a safe place for investment as well as economic stability. The political authorities and the parties in power with their political and diplomatic efforts ensure that Pakistan is safe for the economic projects. The united economic front with the collaboration of political entities in Pakistan is actively playing the role against all the external entities busy in destabilizing Pakistan and defending the country against the propaganda (*Fifth generation warfare a big challenge: DG ISPR, 2020*).

2.6.5. Enhanced Security Measures

India has exploited all the weak areas of Pakistan to wage 5th generation warfare against the state in which one of the serious issues that India has used is the security issues in Pakistan. However, to counter the negative narratives built by India against Pakistan in terms of security concerns Pakistan's authority has taken significant steps to deal with security front. The military readiness has been increased across the borders as well as the additional troops are deployed. In addition to this new division has been created particularly tasked with protection of significant projects and the regions (Jahangir and Bashir, 2022). The major tasks are assigned along the borders with Afghanistan and India. Besides, the fencing of border becomes the major task for the Pakistan's authorities along all of its borders. According to 2020 reports it has been revealed that more than 80% of Pakistan Afghanistan border fencing was completed whereas the fencing along

Pakistan Iran border was also in the process. It has been observed that India was financing terrorism because of border issues but fencing helped not to allow India to intervene in the country and sponsor any kind of negative terrorist activities and then blaming Pakistan on international media.

Finally, the chapter has identified major hybrid warfare strategies of India against Pakistan including the use of different tactics to bring political instability in Pakistan, misusing the economic slowdown of country and making efforts to defame Pakistan on international level. In this chapter a detailed analysis of the Indian fifth generation warfare against Baluchistan have been observed closely because most of the cases that are originated considering fifth generation warfare against Pakistan is from this province. In addition to this, the most prominent effects of 5th generation warfare on Pakistan have been discussed in this chapter including the trust deficit in the state institutions and the impact on society and religion as well as politics of the country. Another important aspect that has been discussed in this chapter is the impact of fifth generation warfare on the national integration of Pakistan. However, the chapter has been concluded with analysis of the effectiveness of the responses of Pakistan to the fifth generation warfare by India. In the next chapter, a detailed analysis of the efforts of Pakistan against fifth generation warfare will be done including all the strategies and policies formulated by the country with their effectiveness.

CHAPTER 3

DETERRENCE AGAINST HYBRID WARFARE/5TH GENERATION

WARFARE

There is no denying the fact that states usually prefer to assess the policies in cost benefit instead of ideological terms. It is because States always have targetable assets and they never want to put them at risk. It does not matter how aggressive a state can be but they always prefer to accept the status quo as compared to losing a confrontation. Therefore, deterrence can work better against states. Contrary to this, non-state actors including terrorist groups and other insurgent groups do not have targetable assets similar to states and therefore accepting a defeat is not a big concern for them. This is a reason that the groups that are highly ideological never change their beliefs even if they get high physical pressure against them. Besides, terrorist groups aim to provoke the state and therefore any reaction from the state strengthens their support against state. It shows that deterrence against non-state actors is difficult. Also, for the deterrence it is important that both the sides recognize the presence of the non-state actors that states usually resist accepting their terrorist opponents (Dawn.com, 2020).

The exception exists in a way that the non-state group having clear state backer and in this regard the state backer can be deterred to constrain the proxy group. For example, the deterrence against Iran can be useful in in constraining Shia militia groups backed by Iran in Iraq. Many other non-state actors have tried to operate like state to hold the territory such as Daesh. It is not only the disruptions in the operations that deter from the attacks but also the significant global intelligence collection efforts against Al Qaeda has made it difficult for them to communicate easily and reduce the communication effectiveness.

3.1. Operation Zarb-e-Azab

To counter the hybrid and fifth generation warfare against Pakistan the operations Zarb-e-Azab was launched in 2014. More than 19,000 intelligence related operations were successfully carried out related to the investigations by army institution of Pakistan. During this operation it was found that terrorist were containing more than 200 tons of explosive with them which is sufficient for the production of improvised explosive devices for 17 years. In this operation about 7500 factories of bombing were demolished completely and more than 4000 terrorists were killed. Besides the safe havens of 999 terrorists were also destroyed successfully and the well-connected networks of the terrorist were not only traced but also prevented for the future. Similarly more than 5,000 troops in which the officers were included gave their lives (Ahmad and Razzaq, 2023).

Pakistan was facing serious setbacks because of the terrorist activities going on in the country and for the different main line activities the land and soil of Pakistan was used by the enemies. However this operation has helped to show Pakistan on International media as a safe and secure state who is not terrorist State instead launch a successful operation to counter these negative activities in Pakistan and avoid the propaganda that enemy countries were having on media forums against Pakistan due to terrorism (Humayun, 2019).

It was successful operation because it has not only restored the state rate of Pakistan but also help to eliminate the militant occupation from the country barring some scattered pockets of sleeper cells. Another key success of this operation was regaining the public trust in the institutions and state as well as reviving the sense of respect and confidence among the public that government is playing an efficient role to resolve and defeat terrorism in the country to regain its International image as well. In addition to this the operation Zarb-e-Azab has also led an

imperative shift in the political discourse of Pakistan and establishes that sometimes reconciliation and appeasement is not enough for the lasting peace and military action can strengthen the integrity of the state (Zahid, 2015).

However it cannot be denied that the operation had certain limitations and challenges.

These are as follows:

- There is no denying the fact that the operation has dislodged and dismantled TTP but the group was relocated to Afghanistan and post a long-term threat to Pakistan because of cross border issues.
- There are also multiple concerns that extremism and intolerance is increased within the society of Pakistan especially between secular-liberals and Islamist which has increased the polarization in the society of the country (Zeb, 2019).
- Another limitation that has been observed in case of operation is that Pakistan has tactical success throughout the operation but it failed to get recognition at both International and regional level due to poor strategic communication as well as weak diplomacy.
- Similarly the operation has not lead to form a comprehensive national counter radicalization policy due to which the operation remained fragile and it can be expected that the operation will be potentially reversible.
- The institutional reforms in both judiciary and police has lacking which limit the overall criminal Justice system capacity to effectively deal with the terrorism in the country to have positive image on national and international level (Ahmad and Razzaq, 2023).
- Lastly the dysfunctional institution named national Center terrorism authority remained a challenge between the stakeholders from civilian setups and military fighting to get the control and ownership of the authority.

3.2. National Action Plan

After the terrorist attack on the army public school the government of Pakistan planned and executed national action plan in January 2015 with a goal to eliminate the organizations that are linked with terrorism and operating in the country. Due to the loss that has been faced in army public school Peshawar incident the plan received a lot of support and collaboration from across the political spectrum in US. In the national action plan the domestic and international policy initiatives were included with a significant aim to combat extremism and terrorism as well as the suspicious groups that are operating in Pakistan (*Prevent, Counter, and Respond-NNSA's Plan to Reduce Global Nuclear Threats*, 2023). It was the result of national action plan that laid the groundwork for the 21st amendment in the constitution of Pakistan which was established for the rapid military court trials and then it was resulted in the reinstatement of capital punishment. The several initiatives that has been taken under the national action plan include the establishment of special military tribunals, NACTA, the armed groups prohibition the prevention of hate speech the creation of special anti-terrorism Force as well as blocking financial sources to the terrorist organizations with an aim to protect the minorities in the countries as well as to reform the madrasa system. It has been observed in the investigation that reforms for the madrasa were required and therefore it was considered among top 20 points of the national action plan (*5th Generation Warfare: 10 Protection Strategies*, 2023). The significant efforts that has been made under national action plan include many and some of the most prominent that has helped to maintain a good reputation of Pakistan on International level are discussed below which has helped Pakistan to ensure its positive and secure State position to International media to avoid any kind of 5th generation warfare tactics from the enemy States. It is because the incident of army public school challenged the statehood of the Pakistan as well as its most strong institution of

army and its security. Pakistan faced a lot of backlash after this incident questioning the safety by Pakistan army as well as the hate was spread for the institution among the general public. However the NAP proved to be an effective effort to regain the trust of public and deal to counter negative narrative and propaganda on media.

- The security forces under national action plan carried out about 54,376 operations that resulted in 60,420 arrests. Besides all the senior leadership involved with the terrorist organizations were listed in the exit control list of the country and it was insured that all the members of any outfit connecting with terrorist groups will be arrested.
- It was aim of the national action plan to reform the madrasa system for which it was tried to seize all the hate books and other materials and in this way several stores were shut down who were selling the books with hated content. Similarly more than 2000 individuals suspected of spreading hate speech were arrested and all of these individuals were prosecuted by different agencies.
- To control the financial support to different terrorist organizations the State Bank of Pakistan blocked about 2 billion dollars in different bank accounts of different organizations of around 12 accounts (Tackling Hate, 2020).
- In addition to this law enforcement agencies ensured to track down the different schemes of money laundering and the people who were involved in those schemes such as Hundi and Hawala. The reason behind tracking down these schemes was to combat terrorist organizations in terms of financing and therefore national terrorist financing investigation cell was also started its operation to observe any money outflows that have suspicion.

- Moreover, under NAP, more than two hundred groups were designated as organizations which were in list of prohibited and Foreign Ministry of Pakistan banned about 171 groups.
- One of the significant efforts taken under the National Action Plan was the “Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad” in 2017. It was initiated to combat terrorism and the objective of this operation was the elimination of terrorist organizations all across the Pakistan without any differences and discrimination. In this operation both the Pakistani army and the air force supported each other and participated to counter the hideouts of terrorists. However, the active involvement of civil armed forces has been also observed throughout the operation such as FCs KPK, Pakistan Rangers, police, and FCs Balochistan. It was ensured that all the facilitators for financing the terrorist organizations are identified and eliminated from the country whether they are involved in funding directly or indirectly (UNESCO, 2023).

3.2.1. Impact of National Action Plan in Context of 5th Generation Warfare

National action plan has played a vital role in countering the tactics of 5th generation warfare in Pakistan as well. Within three months of the establishment of national action plan more than fifty cases that were hardcore terrorists were sent to the military courts for the prosecution. During these three months of implementation of plan about fifty five thousand Afghan refugees expelled from Pakistan. Under different charges more than 32,347 people were arrested by law enforcement agencies and for this about 28,826 operations were launched. The execution of the plan led to the successful freeze of accounts worth 10.2 billion rupees in cash which were suspected for the terror financing. Besides, it further highlighted the risk of communication through different SIM cards and resulted in blocking more than seventy million SIM cards in

Pakistan. All of these SIM cards were issues without verification and in given period, the users failed to verify them (Guterres, 2019).

National action plan successfully supported the measures to deter fifth generation warfare especially with efforts to crack down on the hate speech. Also, the institutions ensure to control over the media narratives and disruption of communication networks involved in the terrorist communications. It has crackdown on the hate speech in which different media outlets, magazines, newspapers, and online media was involved for spread of these speeches. The print and electronic media both was observed closely and not allowed to give space to any of the propaganda that harms the Pakistan's reputation. It was ensured by the concerned institutions that no media platform will be given to any terrorist organization of affiliated people to spread negativity against Pakistan and close surveillance will be done. However, the clear strategy was not decided for this purpose. Also, the extremism will be dealt strictly including Punjab province and for the protection of religious minorities; all the concerned governmental authorities will stop religious extremism (*National Action Plan (NAP) to Combat Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance*, 2019). These efforts positively contributed in the countering of fifth generation warfare tactics. Also, targeting the terrorist organizations' financial sources with strong restriction on their operations under distinct names remained useful for disrupting the economic and organizational foundations of fifth generation warfare in Pakistan. The national action plan has emphasized to strengthen the agencies of intelligence in Pakistan and to reform the criminal justice system. It supported the international cooperation to deal with cross-border terrorist networks which is an imperative way to respond to the serious challenges posed by fifth generation warfare. The restriction on the terrorist organizations abilities to disseminate

propaganda and spread hate through different channels of media, the NAP successfully tried to disrupt the ability of enemy states to wage fifth generation warfare.

3.2.3. National Security Policy of Pakistan 2022-2026 and Fifth Generation Warfare

The new policy that has been revealed by Pakistan titled national security policy for the time of 2022 to 2026 represents an imperative shift of the strategic approach of Pakistan stressing upon the economic security as major ground to the overall security of the nation. The comprehensive framework has included both the traditional security concerns as well as the non-traditional security concerns such as the well-being of the people and human security to deal with the evolving security issues in the country such as 5th generation warfare (Khan, 2021). The policy defines 5th generation warfare threat as the reliance on non-kinetic military actions such as misinformation exploitation of emerging technologies including block chain technology and artificial intelligence as well as cyber-attacks and social engineering which blurs the boundaries between peace and war and lead to more instability and uncertainty which targets the political social and economic fabric of Pakistan (Khalid, 2022). The several tactics that can be employed in 5th generation warfare are the information warfare cyber-attacks proxies and manipulation of narratives as well as economy to undermine the resilience and cohesion of the country. These are traditional and unconventional ways causes erosion of public trust discard as well as the disruption of normal functioning of the society and make it difficult to have effective responses in any national challenge. However Pakistan has revealed national security policy that has recognized all the evolving security threats to Pakistan in which fifth generation warfare danger has also underlined and the policy considers a comprehensive way to address these multifaceted problems (National Security Division, 2022).

3.2.3.1. Measures to Strengthen Economic Security

The national security policy deals with strengthening the economic security of Pakistan as foundation for the overall security of the nation and it acknowledges a stable economy for the secure Nation. It has considered a major factor for the resilience of the country and its ability to counter the negative impacts of fifth generation warfare tactics that targets the financial and economic system of the country. In previous years it has been observed how India has manipulated the online information due to economic situation of Pakistan and it was the reason that Pakistan was added in the gray list of financial action task force (Abrar, 2024). Therefore strengthening the economic security of Pakistan ultimately helps it to deal with the different tactics used by the enemy states to undermine the national security of the country and launch different campaigns against the country. The national security policy has outlined different strategies to increase the stability of the state by boosting the economic stability and it has included focus on foreign direct investment that is based on the exports as well as it focuses on remittances and equitable development to deal with disparities that can be observed in social economic aspects of the country (Dagia, 2022). The vulnerabilities of 5th generation the vulnerabilities that can be exploited by the enemy states to employ 5th generation warfare in Pakistan can be reduced by strengthening the economic foundation of the country. The policy has underlined the importance of channelizing geo-economic location of Pakistan in terms of connectivity investment and trade and focuses on moving towards market based energy sector as well as prioritizing the energy resource development that are based locally. In addition to this it has focused to secure dependable international access to different sources of energy (admin, 2019).

3.2.3.2. Fostering National Cohesion to Counter Threat of 5GW

The national security policy of Pakistan has recognized the significance of national cohesion considering 5th generation warfare threat for Pakistan which seeks to exploit the fault lines in the society and cause several divisions. It has been emphasized in the policy that there is a need to Foster unity in diversity with promotion of social cohesion patriotism as well as the inclusion of national discourse with the help of cultural institutions education and eliminating the narratives that divide the society in different extremes (United Nations, 2019).

It is focusing on fostering the social cohesion and patriotism through religious diversity cultural diversity linguistic diversity as well as national ethnic and religious values. It is highlighted that national unity and social resilience has to be strengthened to counter psychological warfare tactics and information water tactics that are usually employed in 5th generation warfare to demoralize the general public of the country and undermine their confidence and trust in the official government institutions (Ahmad, 2015).

3.2.3.3. Enhancing Security Capabilities

It has mentioned earlier that national security policy of Pakistan is not only addressing the traditional security threat but also non-traditional security threat and therefore different Myers are taken to enhance the capabilities in this regard to address multifaceted threats of fifth generation warfare against Pakistan. Considering that traditional security front the national policy has prioritized to enhance the security of the border as well as capabilities of Navy and defense at line of control with neighboring enemy India because these steps will help to secure the territorial integrity and sovereignty of the country which is targeted by India many times in its 5th generation warfare campaigns on social media against Pakistan (Canada, 2024). This issue has

highlighted many times by India that Pakistan is not a secure country and has territorial issues due to which the risk of extremism and terrorism is more in Pakistan but dealing with the security front on traditional basis will help Pakistan to counter such campaigns. In addition to this, for the non-tradition security front, the policy is emphasizing on the importance of strengthening cyber security, countering efforts against propaganda, and addressing the terrorist threats and violence based on religious sects (Gichki, 2022).

3.2.3.4. Realign Foreign Policy of Pakistan

In the national security policy of Pakistan the realignment of foreign policy has been considered as important aspect of the policy and it seeks to reposition Pakistan as economic hub that will help the country to make its International image secure and shift from security centric state to the peaceful economic state (Ahmad, 2022).

This realignment aims to foster regional connectivity and shared prosperity, which can enhance Pakistan's resilience against 5GW tactics targeting its economic and diplomatic relations. The realignment of foreign policy has an objective to foster the connectivity with the regional Powers as well as shared prosperity which can boost the resilience of Pakistan against the tactics that can be employed to have 5th generation warfare targeting the diplomatic and economic relations of Pakistan with other countries (Khan, 2021). It is stressed in the policy to improve the ties with India but at the same time maintain a steadfast position on the dispute of Kashmir which ensures that Pakistan considers it a vital national security interest. This balanced approach considers addressing the geopolitical tensions in the region which can lead to words serious challenges of fifth generation warfare against Pakistan (Alkin, 2022).

3.2.3.5. National Security Division

In order to coordinate the NSP execution successfully, Pakistan has established National Security Division. It has established under the Office of Prime Minister to ensure its transparency and integrity (International Trade Administration, 2024). The objective of this division is to develop and plan the policies in response to the tactics of fifth generation warfare threats while collaborating with the governmental institutions and agencies.

3.2.3.6. Investment for Cyber Defense Capabilities

The national security policy of Pakistan has emphasize don the need of strengthen the defence capabilities of the country in terms of cybersecurity and protection of cyber infrastructure. It aims to mitigate the impacts of cybercrimes and cyber threats used to Pakistan due to several fault lines. The efforts include the investment by the concerned institutions and government in the modern technologies and the training of the personnel. It also focuses on enhancing the coordination between military and civil agencies for better outcomes and information sharing (Basit, 2016).

3.2.3.7. Countering Propaganda and Disinformation

The national security policy of Pakistan has recognized the hostile threat of disinformation as well as propaganda campaigns that aim to undermine the national interest of Pakistan. To deal it, Center for Advanced Studies in Media and Communication has established. It observed all the negative narratives as well as the promotion of fact-based news and reporting (Amin, 2024).

3.2.3.8. Boost International Cooperation

The national security policy of Pakistan has highlighted the significance of international cooperation to deal with transnational aspects of the 5GW threats and therefore Pakistan has engaged with both global and regional partners in order to share the intelligence and information. It includes the coordinated response and effective strategies to make joint mechanism to deal with the non-traditional emerging security threats (Jamal, 2022).

3.3. National Cybersecurity Policy 2021

Most of the countries are adopting the modern technologies increasingly across different business fears and Pakistan is also among those countries. With an increased number of new business startups the digital transformation programs as well as the entrance of young professionals in the business sphere it has become important for Pakistan to connect the cyber security policy that supports the overarching framework addressing the issues related to privacy and data protection. To get the sense of detail of cyber security policy of Pakistan it is necessary to understand the impact of data sovereignty cyber security and privacy on the countries overall economic well-being (Brownie, 2023).

In July 2021, Pakistan has approved comprehensive national cybersecurity policy which is an improved version of previously shared draft in January 2021. It focuses on a broader vision that includes the security of assets and establishment of resilience through continuous improvement and robust digital ecosystem. The objective is to foster the cybersecurity by emphasizing more on efforts to improve the societal development in terms of social and economic. In the policy, three main challenges and risk factors in terms of cybersecurity in Pakistan has been highlighted (Iqbal, 2023). One of the major concerns include the ownership of

the cybersecurity because it demands the sufficient and appropriate support from the Pakistan's government and the official institutions to ensure that other streams that are responsible for the economic growth of Pakistan are able to contribute in healthy growth and progress as well as the growth must be continuous and sustainable. Due to the lack of governmental support for cybersecurity in past years, Pakistan has faced several problems and many of its assets are undermined (Ashraf et al., 2024).

The problems of lack of governance framework, excessive reliance on external forces, inefficient mechanism of execution, and ineffective human resources for leading administrating, and operating the policy goals have also highlighted. The national cybersecurity policy will be enforced in both the private and public sectors which ensures the uniformity adaptation and compliance with cyber security governance framework. Moreover, some of the sectors including cloud computing and operational technology may need more comprehensive and separate frameworks built on significantly similar structure to support the fulfillment of the policy goals. However, the different keys areas that are covered to be addressed by the policy objectives include the following:

- Establishment of governance framework
- Addressing the critical infrastructure and information systems
- Promotion of data governance and protection
- Establishment of information assurance framework
- Achieving independence and ensuring capacity building
- Promotion of online privacy and establishing information assurance framework
- Emphasizing on adopting risk based approach & national and international cooperation framework (Iqbal, 2023).

- Ensured cybersecurity awareness

In the national cybersecurity policy of Pakistan, six dimensions are significant supporting Pakistan to deal with the online threats and to counter the evolution of fifth generation warfare tactics by the enemy states. First, the emphasis of the Pakistan national cybersecurity policy is one the deterrence. It has declared that cybersecurity on the Pakistan's institution will be considered as aggressive action against the country's sovereignty as well as all the required and retaliatory steps will be taken to ensure the safety and security of the institution (Kamboh et al., 2024). It has further stated that any kind of cyberattack on the country will be under the two categories i.e., category I and category II aggressions against Pakistan's sovereignty and state will take all the steps to defend. Second, the cyber governance policy committee (CGPC) is formed. The purpose of its formation is to execute the policy fully at national level and determine strategy and action on time. The committee includes senior officers and secretariats from thirteen different organizations (Jamal, 2024). However, the head of the body is not confirmed but the decisions need to be approved by Cabinet under the Prime Minister of Pakistan. Importantly, the governance body needs to assure the ownership of the policy at national level for the policy initiatives designed related to security and cyber-governance. Besides, it is the responsibility of the CGPC to ensure strategic oversight over issues related to national cybersecurity. Third, the important dimension of the information sharing has been covered in the policy. It must be ensured that the information is shared and proper mechanism is followed for the protection against any kind of cyber-attacks at all the levels and ensure electronic identification cybercrime monitoring as well as security of online data (Khalid, 2022). In addition to this all the facilities and support system must be provided to the organizations to protect the online privacy. However, in the policy the privacy protection is considered but the details related to the integrated system are not yet

shared. The fourth dimension that is important in the policy is to ensure the support to all the stakeholders to establish an internal framework that includes the entire private as well as the public institutions to protect against any cyber-crime and ensure a cyber safe ecosystem. The internal framework must be secured enough and have secured national information system and infrastructure (United Nations, n.d.) The objective behind this aspect is to have a resilient system in the organizations and institutions to protect critical infrastructure as well as boost the confidence among the users and citizens about the integrated system. In addition to this, the policy has considered the creation of skilled experts considering the training programs for which the NCCS has been established by the government where the training programs will be done. Furthermore, the policy has also considered excellence centers establishment for better access to the training programs. Lastly, it has been emphasized to create awareness among the citizens of Pakistan related to the cyber security issues and therefore establish a partnership between public and private sectors to provide both operational as well as the technical support. According to the policy document the aim is to guarantee the online data privacy as well as the privacy for the important content of citizens of Pakistan, the private entities as well as the government departments (Masehullah et al., 2023).

However, the main objective of the Pakistan national cybersecurity policy is to establish an active cyber defence or the offensive posture ensuring the cyber security governance as well as protection and resilience of national information structures and internet-based services. The aim of the policy also includes the protection of information system and infrastructure of the government, and development of information security assurance framework with increasing the awareness related to the cyber security among the citizens. Moreover, the objectives include development of mechanisms and regulations related to cybercrime responses (Nawaz et al., 2023).

In addition to this, the policy is also mentioned having a testing system to check the integrity of products online.

The national cyber security policy of Pakistan has placed the cyber-attacks at par with attacks on the significant aspects of the country's sovereignty and security and associated it with the national security strategy. In this regard the deterrence strategy has come out very prominently. There is no denying the fact that Pakistan has not yet shared how it is going to retaliate but it is expected that it will utilize all the weapons. On one hand, considering the use of nuclear weapons the retired general Khalid Kidwai who was maintained the position of director general of strategic plans division of Pakistan stated in one of the interviews in 2002 back Pakistan can utilize the nuclear weapon against the hostile neighboring country and put focus on the four main conditions. First it is said that in any case India attacks Pakistan and country the large territory. Secondly, the case India continues to the strangling of Pakistan in terms of economy. Third, the efforts of India to destroy the larger part of Pakistan or the air forces of Pakistan can be a reason (Layton et al., 2017). Lastly, if India ever pushed Pakistan in destabilization of political sphere as well as creating the internal subversion in Pakistan. However, in these four terms Pakistan has added the fifth and for most condition which is attack on its cyber space. In this age of globalization and the threat of 5th generation warfare the statements given by the officials many years back can be used as a tactic by the India and therefore it was mandatory for Pakistan to have a stable and significant framework to deal with such propaganda against Pakistan (Shaikh, 2021).

Pakistan has also executed and adopted completely the full spectrum deterrence considering the use of nuclear weapons and has explained it as concept of full spectrum deterrence to respond any kind of gaps that may bother the Pakistan army or exploited by Indian army based on cold war

doctrine. It is because these gaps have been plugged by the nuclear weapons tactics which are completely integrated with conventional weapons to wage wars (Krishnan, 2022).

Counting the successes of Pakistan to deal with the 15th generation warfare against the country the national cyber security policy of Pakistan is on the lines of other developed nations including Russia, United States, United Kingdom, China, and France. It is because all of these countries have offensive part in context of different and they have associated their cyber policies with national security policies of the country. The national cyber security strategy of United States of 2018 emphasizes on the offensive operations now which was mentioned earlier in general terms only. Secondly, the cyber security policy of Australia also stresses on the strong system of defense that not only detect the vulnerabilities but also highlights the global responsibilities in this regard. In addition to this, the cyber warfare is considered as part of hybrid warfare by Russia in which Russia plays a decisive role (Ministry of Information technology and telecommunication, 2021). Considering France, it has separate section of offensive cyber strategy that considers the attack on its military forces as an attack on its national security and must be retaliated for the neutralization of the source. However, United Kingdom accepts the planning of national offence and unifies its different entities in this regard whereas Japan calls to enhance the deterrence policies. Considering China in terms of cyber security strategy the concept there is that there can be no national security without the presence of cyber security and therefore cyber deterrence must be considered important and it places at par with nuclear deterrence (Muhammad, 2024).

3.3.1 Provisions in Pakistan's National Cybersecurity Policy Countering 5th Generation Warfare

The Pakistan's national cyber security policy of 2021 has established a comprehensive framework that helps to ensure the security of the cyberspace of Pakistan as well as its critical infrastructure against any cyber threats such as the 5th generation warfare. The significant objectives of the policy has discussed that includes the emphasis of the policy on the deterrence and declaring that any kind of cyber related attack on the Pakistan's institutions will be an aggressive act against the sovereignty of the Pakistan and therefore the retaliation measures will be taken by the Pakistan to defend itself against such aggression (Lyu, 2024). Similarly, the task of CGPC to assert the national level ownership related to the policy initiatives considering the cyber governance and security plays an important role to counter the threats of fifth generation as well as the implementation of the policy at national level can help to deal with any threat related to hybrid warfare. It is also highlighted that the policy aims to ensure to support all the stakeholders to establish internal framework that will not only protect the cyber ecosystem but also ensure the security of the national systems information and the infrastructure which is useful for having resilience against any kind of cyber-attack (National Security Division, 2022). Also, in the fifth generation warfare tactics it has been studied the misinformation and propaganda is spread online and the cybersecurity policy of Pakistan deals with having accurate information sharing mechanism to monitor any kind of cyberattacks and the privacy of online information. Moreover, the awareness among citizens for the cybersecurity can be helpful in mitigating the fifth generation warfare because the establishment of private and public partnership will help in having secured technical and operational assistance and get the public trust. Furthermore,

strengthening the ability to counter the fifth generation warfare by the policy aims of capacity building and training for the cybersecurity can be useful (Pradhan, 2021).

To conclude, the chapter has analyzed the deterrence strategies against hybrid warfare or the fifth generation warfare in the contemporary world and the significant policies and efforts that has been made by Pakistan institutions in this regard. Some of the important efforts and policies that are discussed include the operation Zarb e Azb and the national action plan formulated by the trusted institutions of the country. Besides, the positives and negatives of each step have also been evaluated based on the facts and statistics gathered after the implementation of these policies. Besides, the influence of these measures has been observed in the context of 5th generation warfare. In addition to this, the national security policy of Pakistan has been discussed in detail with all the areas that it covers including national cohesion, security capabilities of country, and realignment of the foreign policy of the country. Besides, the detailed analysis of the influence of this policy on the national security division and the investment measures for the cyber defense capabilities are also considered in the analysis with efforts to counter the disinformation and propaganda and with an increase of international cooperation. Another important policy that has been discussed includes the national cyber security policy of Pakistan with all its benefits and loopholes. In the next chapter, the research's main findings will be highlighted and the recommendations will be provided to ensure the cybersecurity of Pakistan.

CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1. Conclusion

In conclusion, the globalized world with an access to internet connectivity, the risk online security threats have increased. The world has moved from conventional security threats to semi-conventional and non-conventional threats including the risk of war over information, culture, religion and other such issues. One can observe and the recent times that most of the problems arise due to political and economic problems rather pure military conflicts between the states. Considering these security threats the research has conducted to analyze the Indian 5th generation warfare against Pakistan and to analyze the countless strategies of Pakistan in this regard. Research has investigated the significant tactics used by India in domain of 5th generation warfare against Pakistan and the response of Pakistan to these unconventional non-kinetic and hybrid threats from the outside. In order to make study unbiased and reliable multi-dimensional and comprehensive understanding of 5th generation warfare has been ensured as well as the critical analysis of research themes are done to identify some of the major and potential threats to

Pakistan posed by 5th generation warfare of India and exploring the innovative countries strategies as well as new policy frameworks of Pakistan. To better analyze the situation the research is implemented the hybrid warfare theory and apply all the respective concepts on it. However, the qualitative research methodology is considered but both primary and secondary sources are consulted in the data collection especially the official reports are considered to come up with official statistics regarding the attacks of information and fifth generation warfare of India against Pakistan.

The problems between Pakistan and India are not new and since the inception of Pakistan the conflicts between the two neighboring countries started that has gained its peak in this age of globalization and information technology. The conflicts have come out of the conventional ways to the unconventional and hybrid formats where it is difficult to identify the main attacker but the national security of the country can be damaged a lot. The purpose of these kinds of attacks and threats is to defame the country and do propaganda against the country's reputation to let country be alone on the international forum. India is utilizing all the tactics to defame Pakistan and have manipulated many occasions in its favor to show bad reputation of Pakistan on international level. Multiple cases have been observed in the recent times in which it has been found that India remained involved in the espionage activities as well as in other operations in Pakistan to create mess and chaos within the Pakistani society and to flame the sensitivities and ethnic differences in Pakistan. One of the major issues that have been highlighted throughout the research is the presence of intelligence agency of India which is RAW in Balochistan province. In addition to this, it has also confessed by Kalbhushan Jadhav, who was the official of Indian Navy force and he was accused of carrying different activities against Pakistan and caught by the local people in 2016 and handed over to Pakistan's military. However, other than these direct operations in

Pakistan, India have also manipulated many events in its favor and are shown it as propaganda on international television. Some of the significant examples in this regard that has been found through the research include the presence of Taliban in Pakistan as well as showing the negative side of Pakistan's economy and political instability to list Pakistan in financial action task force. Due to these efforts of India Pakistan has also got sanctions by FATF. It has been proven in many of the international reports and official news that India is using different warfare tactics against Pakistan and manipulating its information.

The major warfare strategies of India against Pakistan is to bring the political instability, misusing the economics slowdown in Pakistan as well as doing international deformation efforts against Pakistan to manipulate public opinion and influence them with propaganda to foster animosity against the country.

The major region that has been targeted by India is Balochistan because of its degrading economic conditions and political instability. In the research it has been found that there are multiple online social media channels that are managed by India and they are supporting the negative perspectives about Pakistan and making efforts to go the seeds of enmity within the society of Pakistan showing that Balochistan needs foreign and international support and independence from its own country Pakistan. Several articles have been published to spread this narrative and defame Pakistan.

It cannot be denied that the efforts of 5th generation warfare of India against Pakistan have caused several negative effects on Pakistan. Some of the major issues that have been heightened and got affected due to the 5th generation warfare on Pakistan include the severe trust deficit in the state institutions especially between the civil and military institution. In addition to this, a significant impact on the politics of Pakistan have been observed because social media has used to

spread misinformation and disinformation that distorts the public opinion as well as erode their trust from the democratic institutions of Pakistan which has not only directly impacted the electoral system but also the institutions themselves has faced severe problems due to cyber-attacks. The research has found a significant example of 2020 stock exchange attack on Pakistan in this regard. Besides, the effect of 5th generation warfare of India against Pakistan includes weakening of social fabric and Pakistan as well as the religious diversity. By the espionage activities, the ethnic divides in Pakistan has been fueled by hostile agency that lead to more intolerance as well as refusal to the peaceful co-existence in the country. Due to the negative efforts of India the certain hostilities have also been inflamed in the country that undermines the government's legitimacy. The serious impact that has been found due to Indian hybrid warfare tactics has caused the addition of Pakistan in the FATF list. In order to include Pakistan in financial action task force greatest India has used several tactics showing Pakistan as unsafe country and providing support to terrorism and terror financing.

However Pakistan and its institutions are not ignoring the threats of information warfare and responding to the India's generation warfare with the effective strategies. It has strengthened its information and cyber warfare capabilities as well as try to spread the awareness related to the tactics that India is using against Pakistan related to the 5th generation warfare to improve the national resilience. In addition to this, several diplomatic efforts have been done by the authorities of Pakistan and the defense forces as well as the ISI have full capacity to counter the offensive acts of India in this regard. The research has also revealed that Pakistan is taking several measures for the economic cohesion and political stability and one of the significant examples is China Pakistan economic corridor and the efforts of Pakistan to take part in different national and international economic collaborations. Pakistan is also improving its both conventional and non-

conventional potentials to deal with security issues and the concern authorities ensure to secure the Pakistan's border.

Pakistan has done several efforts to deal with 5th generation warfare waged by India against Pakistan in which the most prominent efforts to counter India include operation Zarb-e-Azab. Under this program launched in 2014 and more than 19000 operations of intelligence were carried out successfully by the army institution of Pakistan. Another effort made by the government of Pakistan is to eliminate all organizations that have any kind of association with the terrorist activities and the national action plan was launched in 2015. Thousands of operations were carried out that resulted in the arrest of thousands of terrorist leaderships and people associated with these organizations. The national action plan has significant impact to counter the 5th generation warfare because it includes the surveillance of media and the other communication channels to counter any negative narrative against Pakistan as well as to counter the religious extremism. In addition to this, the most specific policy made by Pakistan to counter 5th generation warfare is national security policy of Pakistan 2022-2026. It has included different domains such as strengthening economic security, fostering the national cohesion and enhancing the security capabilities. It has also included the need of realignment of foreign policy of Pakistan and a national security division has successfully executed the plan. Besides, the international cooperation is considered as an important element to counter the propaganda and disinformation as well as the investment for the cyber defense capabilities has been highlighted in this policy. To specifically deal with cyber security threats and information warfare Pakistan has also adopted national cyber security policy 2021 which includes the important objectives such as the promotion of data governance and protection the online privacy as well as establishment of governance framework. They research has concluded with significant recommendations for the country and

its institutions to deal with negative impacts of 5GW as well as highlighted the successful implementation of different policies and laws by developed countries from which Pakistan can learn and adopt the relevant policy for its own security and safety. The major countries that are focused in this regard include Finland, China, United States, Russia, and Sweden.

Therefore, the research has revealed that the case studies of the developed nations that are also facing the threats of 5th generation and information warfare shows that the problem of 5GW is a potential threat for all the countries in the present time that the enemies can use and can easily hide their identities. It also shows the severity of the issue and need of urgent and effective measures to deal with them. The availability and an easy access to the online platforms have made it easier for the attackers to manipulate the information online and use it in their favor. Pakistan is not the only country having the threats but must be prepared to deal with any online attack and the Indian tactics because it directly defames the nation as a whole.

Findings

- The 5th generation warfare tactics of India are multi-dimensional. They are investing significantly in disinformation campaigns integrated cyber-attacks as well as several proxies are used to achieve the strategic objective by India and the significant examples have been observed in negative activities of India in Baluchistan.
- The counter strategies of Pakistan are focused to enhance the cyber resilience as well as countering the disinformation campaigns on media. Also, Pakistan is significantly investing in building national resilience through strategic communication as well as legislative efforts.
- The effectiveness of the responses Pakistan has made against India's 5th generation warfare tactics varies with significant steps that are made in different areas including

cyber defense. However, it has not ended the challenges of cyber-attacks and many challenges are present in countering the pervasive impact of propaganda and disinformation as well as the psychological operations against Pakistan.

- The geo-political context including the recent developments in Afghanistan as well as the competition among great powers influences not only the strategic environment but also the effectiveness of the strategies made by Pakistan to counter the 5th generation warfare waged by India.
- Pakistan has faced severe negative impacts of Indian 5th generation warfare and it has damaged its national as well as international reputation. There is no denying the fact that the disinformation campaigns have heated the ethnic conflicts as well as other social problems and economic issues in Pakistan.
- It is recommended that the evolving nature of 5th generation warfare needs continuous adaptation as well as innovation in designing the counter strategies as well as it highlights the demand for a flexible and dynamic approach to the national security of Pakistan. It is also found that international alliances and corporation are playing significant role to bolster capabilities of Pakistan to address the complex cyber related threats posed by generation warfare.

4.2. Recommendations for Pakistan to Counter 5GW

Pakistan has serious threat of 5GW in the contemporary time especially due to its strategic locations and the ongoing events in its neighboring countries. Pakistan remained one of the important players in South Asian region due to its natural resources and military capabilities. US on one side always preferred Pakistan's support in different military operations whereas China as the important player of region cooperates with Pakistan for better regional stability. These factors

put more pressure on the Pakistan to ensure its safety and security and make the effective strategies to deal with the evolving convention, sub-conventional, and non-conventional threats. The threat of 5GW is not only limited to the developing nations but also developed countries are at risk., The case study examples of the developed nation's strategies to deal with the 5GW shows the importance of effective measure in the globalized world. Pakistan can learn from the developed nation's strategies and come up with better and successful implementation of the policies. Some of the strategies that Pakistan should adopt are discussed below:

4.2.1. Counter-Strategies to 5th Generation Warfare by Developed Countries & Lessons for Pakistan

The threat of 5th generation warfare is equally a concern for all the developed and developing countries and every state is busy in policy making and taking effective initiatives to counter this problem. With advancement, it has become difficult to say that everything is completely secure and the threat of fifth generation warfare is ended but efforts can be made for the deterrence. Some of the significant examples of the developed countries who have implemented successful initiative sin this regard are as follows:

4.2.2. Finland's Approach to Deterrence

Finland has employed a strategy named total defense in order to get better both conventional as well as sub conventional threats especially from Russia. This comprehensive strategy integrates resilience deterrents and defensive actions in order to deal with hybrid activities by adversaries. It has also included the offensive actions to ensure the safety of the Finland. There is no denying the fact that Finland has maintained significantly robust conventional capabilities of military and always conduct several large scale exercises with

different NATO and non-NATO forces to demonstrate its strength. Specifically to deal with the disinformation from the Russian side the country has organized the committee named ministry of defense security committee with a responsibility to coordinate with agencies and entities both governmental and non-governmental to share important information and let public be informed about the outside threat to the country. Being a leader in the cyber defense the country has also hosted European center of excellence for countering hybrid threats that focus on the hybrid threats from non-state actors and Russia as well. Finland has put most of its focus on educating its citizens so that they can identify any kind of disinformation and develops the skills to understand the agenda and avoid any kind of propaganda that can harm the image of Finland as well as they work for building societal resilience (NATO, 2021).

4.2.3. Efforts of United States in Integrated Deterrence

Considering the efforts in integrated deterrence, the United States has recognized the need to evolve the deterrence strategy in order to deal with the 5th generation warfare threats. To deal with the 5th generation warfare the most significant step taken by United States is 2022 national defense strategy that has introduced the concept of integrated and it deals with all the threat domains including conventional information space nuclear and cyber. The country is effectively working to include all the governmental and business leaders into the planning of EUCOM as well as its operations and exercises in order to come up with more coordinated comprehensive and integrated model of deterrents (Jackson, 2024). The United States European command seeks to develop a fusion cell related to information warfare in order to avail and educate the government agencies personals as well as the private sectors in terms of information capabilities and the way these agencies and entities can integrate those capabilities into their operations for safe and secure flow of information. Besides, United Nations is actively working to incorporate

the robust exercises in collaboration with all the governmental and non-governmental organizations for better partnership and building capabilities to counter the sub conventional aggression in the contemporary world (Maurer and Nelson, 2021). In addition to this, United States has invested in the cyber defense and developed advanced intelligence and surveillance capabilities to identify any potential threat of cyber-attacks. Moreover, the investments in the cutting-edge technologies such as artificial intelligence and block chain are significant efforts United States is doing to keep the security of the information of country safe (Gen, 2024).

4.2.4. Sweden's whole of Society Approach against 5GW

Sweden is among the countries that have taken effective measures to counter the 5th generation warfare threats in the contemporary time and one of the significant approach of the country is total defense 2021 to 2025 plan which involve all the governmental and armed forces as well as it includes the industry and civil society for building the capabilities and improve partnership to ensure that the country is at less vulnerable position and more capable to learn effective practices and be more resilient to deal with conventional and sub conventional threats (Concordiam, 2023).

4.2.5. Russia's Efforts to combat 5GW

Russia is known for utilizing range of the techniques to deal with the evolving threat of fifth generation warfare. First, the deterrence policy has been adopted and the political subversion and proxy sanctuary is ensured counter the adversaries influences (Derleth, 2020). Other efforts from the Russia's governmental authorities to undermine the cohesive efforts of its adversaries include the intervention through the military forces deployment to borders and the psychological operations with information manipulation. Moreover, the negotiation manipulation including

dividing the western alliance are prominent steps taken by the Russia to counter 5GW against it (Chivvis, 2017).

4.2.6. China and 5GW Strategies

China is known as one of the rising super power and the greatest economic power on international level. The increasing development in the state is also increasing the risk of fifth generation warfare to undermine the China's development and economic gains. To counter the threats of information warfare and other non-conventional threats, it is implementing the strategies focusing to enhance the air force capabilities (Handler, 2023). It has invested a lot to transform the military forces structure in order to prioritize the strategic early warnings. Moreover, long-range air power projections and development of antimissile systems especially the development of space based assets to improve aerospace capabilities shown the China's resilience and responsiveness to counter the 5GW. Also, China's policies are challenged many times when it comes to the maritime security and therefore to avoid any propaganda China has integrated its forces to conduct multi-domain operations (Research, 2024).

Pakistan can learn and adopt the relevant policies and strategies of other developed countries to counter the 5GW wage by India against it.

4.2.7. Strengthening Strategic Communication Capabilities

There is a need to strengthen the static communication capabilities by Pakistan and therefore it should enhance these capabilities to counter the disinformation and propaganda campaigns of India against it. It is required for Pakistan to strengthen the social media presence and media outreach to deliver its strategic messages to the other countries as well as the International community in a positive manner (Nye, 2008). Pakistan must invest in modern and

advanced data analytics technologies and monitoring tools to timely identify any potential threat of disinformation and propaganda and able to respond to information tactics adopted by India. In addition to this a robust strategic narrative must be developed to project the perspective of Pakistan and counter the narratives given by India to defame the state (Lyu, 2024).

4.2.8. Strengthening Cyber Security Infrastructure

One of the significant recommendations for Pakistan to counter the 5th generation warfare wage by India is to fortify the cyber security infrastructure of Pakistan. Pakistan must strengthen the infrastructure and capabilities in order to protect the important information systems and networks from the espionage and cyber-attack efforts of India. To achieve this objective some of the milestones on which Pakistan consider include investment in advance cyber defense technologies and ensure to have early warning systems (Amin, 2024). Secondly, they must improve the coordination between military and civilian cyber entities to have unified response in case of any cyber-attack or propaganda. In addition to this, Pakistan authorities must conduct stress tests and vulnerability assessments in order to understand and identify any kind of potential cyber risks.

4.2.9. Fortify Intelligence & Counter-Intelligence Capabilities

To counter the threat of 5th generation warfare, Pakistan must continue developing the robust intelligence gathering as well as strengthen its counterintelligence mechanism in order to identify the Indian subversive activities and neutralize activities within Pakistan. To implement this strategy and recommendation some of the significant steps include the improvement in interagency coordination as well as sharing of information among different departments to facilitate a unified and comprehensive response in case of any cyber-attack (Azad and Haider,

2020). Secondly, it includes improving and strengthening the technical and human intelligence capabilities in order to collect the information that is actionable as well as the implementation of proactive counterintelligence strategies to resist any espionage and Indian covert operations against Pakistan.

4.2.10. Foster Resilience in Response and National Cohesion

There is no denying the fact that no strategy can work without a national cohesion and therefore Pakistan must stress upon for strength national cohesion and resilience against the negative impacts of hybrid and 5th generation warfare by India. It includes the erosion of public trust as well as the polarization of society (Krishnan, 2022). Some of the important strategies that can be effective in forcing national cohesion and resilience include the promotion of inter-ethnic and inter-faith harmony to deal with divisive narratives. Besides, the role of state institutions must be strengthened to gain public trust and maintain the social harmony in Pakistan. In addition to this, a comprehensive civic education program must be implemented on the national level by the responsible authorities to spread awareness among masses related to the need of skills to deal with 5th generation warfare tactics (Hadjitorov and Sokolov, 2018).

4.2.11. Provision of Funding and Required Resources

Another recommendation or a strategy that can be implemented effectively to deal with 5th generation warfare threat to Pakistan is that the governmental authorities must provide the required funding and resources for the development of counter strategies as well as their effective implementation. It is because without adequate availability of funding and resources it is not possible for any of the state institution as well as the non-governmental entities to build an environment that can counter the information warfare (Stoutland, n.d.). The strategies to ensure

the availability of adequate funding and resources include the allocation of sufficient funds for the research, capacity building, as well as the upgrading of technology in Pakistan. It is because with passing time the threats have different nature for which it is important to work on the advanced technologies and have more comprehensive research for capacity building. Besides, the government of Pakistan must prioritize the threat of 5th generation warfare in context of national security planning as well as make it a priority in budgeting of national security (Haider and Azad, 2021). In addition to this, the effective implementation of providing required funds and resources can be ensured by encouraging both public and private sectors to have positive partnership as well as the international collaborations to leverage the more resources.

4.2.12. Influential Public Diplomacy and Soft Power

The threat of 5th generation warfare cannot be counter without having strong public diplomacy and therefore Pakistan should explore different ways to leverage its ideological, cultural, and religious power to counter the influence and narrative of India on international level. These efforts include the promotion of Islamic identity of Pakistan and its role as progressive nation of Muslims having moderate identity (Nye, 2008). It is because Pakistan has been targeted many times on the basis of Islamic extremism and therefore it is important to ensure the Islamic identity of Pakistan as progressive and moderate instead of extremist identity. Secondly, it is important to highlight the contributions of Pakistan for the regional development, stability, and peace to influence its soft power and let other countries to acknowledge its efforts in the region. There is an urgent need of proactive public diplomacy initiatives in which Pakistan can come up with several cultural exchange programs to have better people-to-people interactions (Jahangir and Bashir, 2022).

4.2.13. Maintain Nuclear Deterrence

It is a fact that in the contemporary time the information warfare and hybrid warfare have become a serious challenge but Pakistan must not ignore its conventional and nuclear capabilities and continue to strengthen its deterrents capabilities in order to deal with any kind of aggression and escalation by India that can also be an element of its 5th generation warfare techniques. Therefore, it is important for Pakistan authority to keep conventional and nuclear deterrents as the major component in the overall defense strategy of Pakistan (Nye, 2019).

Therefore, the successful implementation of the suggestions can play a vital role to support Pakistan to fight against India's fifth generation warfare and ensure the national integrity and sovereignty of the state.

4.2.14. Ways to Improve Pakistan's National Security Policy

1. **Improving Coordination between Different Government Agencies:** The NSP calls for greater coordination between different government agencies, such as the military, intelligence agencies, and law enforcement agencies. However, this coordination has been lacking in the past, which has hampered the country's ability to respond to security threats.
2. **Strengthen Border Security:** Pakistan's borders make it easy for terrorists and other criminals to cross into the country. The NSP calls for better border security, but this has been a challenge due to the country's size and the rugged terrain of its borders.
3. **Crack down On Terrorist Financing:** Pakistan is a major source of terrorist financing, The NSP calls for measures to crack down on terror financing, but this has been difficult to do due to the country's complex financial system.

4. Countering Extremism: There is a high level of extremism in Pakistan. Which can be a breeding ground for terrorism. The NSP calls for measure to counter extremism, but this a long –term challenge.
5. Addressing Poverty and Unemployment: Poverty and unemployment are major problems in Pakistan, which can make people more valuable to radicalization. The NSP calls for measures to address poverty and unemployment, but this will take time and resources.
6. Cyber Security Firewall: Government used firewall technology to control cyber-attacks and harmful network traffic. But the youth’s response was negative due to the slowdown of internet. Most of the unemployed youth is doing work from home and the sudden slowdown of internet affected their freelance work. The firewall should be implemented layer by layer to avoid the internet disruption and technical issues. Moreover, there should be provincial level centers to educate the youth as well as to handle cyber issues.

Improving Pakistan National security is a complex and challenging task but it is essential for the country’s long term stability and prosperity.

REFERENCES

- 5th Generation Warfare: 10 Protection Strategies*. (2023, September 15). Guardian AI. <https://blog.guardianai.io/defending-yourself-in-the-age-of-5th-generation-warfare-strategies-for-protection/>
- Abrar, A. (2024, February 27). *Hybrid Warfare and Its Influence on Pakistan Political Landscape*. Modern Diplomacy. <https://modern diplomacy.eu/2024/02/28/hybrid-warfare-and-its-influence-on-pakistan-political-landscape/>
- Ahmad, W., & Razzaq, F. (2023). HYBRID WARFARE AND PAKISTAN: IMPLICATIONS AND RESPONSE STRATEGY. *Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology*, 20(2), 2348. <https://archives.palarch.nl/index.php/jae/article/download/12082/10622/23883>
- admin. (2019, January 15). *Fifth Generation Warfare and the Challenges for Pakistan*. Pakistanpolitico. <https://pakistanpolitico.com/fifth-generation-warfare-and-the-challenges-for-pakistan/>
- Ahmad, S. (2015, August 18). *After Zarb-E-Azb: Now What?* • Stimson Center. Stimson Center. <https://www.stimson.org/2015/after-zarb-e-azb-now-what/>
- Ahmad, S. (2022). Cyber Security Threat and Pakistan's Preparedness: An Analysis of National Cyber Security Policy 2021. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Research*, 5(1), 25–40. <https://doi.org/10.37605/pjhssr.v5i1.381>
- Alkin, K. (2022, August 13). *Fifth-generation warfare and global challenges* | Column. Daily Sabah. <https://www.dailysabah.com/opinion/columns/fifth-generation-warfare-and-global-challenges>
- Amin, M. (2024, March 17). *5th Generation Warfare and its Impact on Pakistan*. Global Defense Insight. <https://defensetalks.com/5th-generation-warfare-and-its-impact-on-pakistan/>
- Abbasi, A. (2020, July 1). *BLA has known Indian connection*. Www.thenews.com.pk.

- <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/680356-bla-has-known-indian-connection>
- Achakzai, J. (2019, October 14). *FATF: International Lobbying by India Might Retain Pakistan in Greylist*. Global Village Space. <https://www.globalvillagespace.com/fatf-international-lobbying-by-india-might-retain-pakistan-in-greylist/>
- Ahmed, N. (2016, August 20). *Modi spoke India's mind over CPEC*. The Express Tribune. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1166455/modi-spoke-indias-mind-cpec>
- Alexandre Alaphilippe, G. M., Adamczyk, R., & Grégoire, A. (2020, December 9). *Indian Chronicles: deep dive into a 15-year operation targeting the EU and UN to serve Indian interests*. EU DisinfoLab. <https://www.disinfo.eu/publications/indian-chronicles-deep-dive-into-a-15-year-operation-targeting-the-eu-and-un-to-serve-indian-interests/>
- Azam, M. (2021). Pakistan -India Security Paradox: Between Deterrence and Coercive Diplomacy. *JSSA*, 7(1), 161–181. <https://thesvi.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/dr-marayam-azam.pdf>
- Azad, Tahir Mahmood & Haider, Muhammad. (2020). A Critical Analysis of Strategies to Counter Hybrid Warfare: Way Forward for Pakistan. *Asian Journal of International Peace & Security (AJIPS)*, 4(2), 295-310. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/350711970_A_Critical_Analysis_of_Strategies_to_Counter_Hybrid_Warfare_Way_Forward_for_Pakistan
- Anis, M. (2019, April 30). *Time is up for PTM leadership: DG ISPR*. www.thenews.com.pk. <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/464948-time-is-up-for-ptm-leadership-dg-ispr>
- Ashraf, R., Khan, M. H., Qazalbash, F., & Rahamad, M. S. (2022). INDO-PAK STANDOFF 2019: A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF SELECTED TWEETS FROM INTER-SERVICES PUBLIC RELATIONS. *Journal of Nusantara Studies (JONUS)*, 7(2), 314-335.
- Ashraf, M., Scholar, N., Mustafa, sG., & Kakar, A. (2021). Fifth Generation Warfare and its Challenges to Pakistan. *Journal of Int'L Affairs*, 4(1). <https://pjia.com.pk/index.php/pjia/article/download/118/83>
- Askari, M. U., & Niazi, L. K. (2022). Indian Hybrid War against Pakistan: A Strategic Theory Perspective. *Journal of Indian Studies*, 8(1), 189-208.

- Basrur, R. (2019). India and china: a managed nuclear rivalry? *The Washington Quarterly*, 42(3), 151-170.
- Bibi, A., & Meer, H. (2023). Fifth Generation War Against Pakistan Its Dynamics, Implications and Response by State Institutions. *Review of Education, Administration & Law*, 6(1), 41-50.
- Buzan, B. (1991). New patterns of global security in the twenty-first century. *International Affairs*, 67(3), 431–451.
- Basit, A. (2016, June 27). *Pakistan's Counterterrorism Operation: Myth vs. Reality*. TheDiplomat.com. <https://thediplomat.com/2016/06/pakistans-counterterrorism-operation-myth-vs-reality/>
- Bryman, A., Foster, L., Sloan, L., & Clark, T. (2021). *Bryman's Social Research Methods* (6th ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Butt, I. A. (2021). Has a 'fifth generation war' started between India and Pakistan? *Al-Jazeera*.
- Brownie, E. (2023, September 11). *Fifth Generation Warfare*. OAF Nation. <https://oafnation.com/blogs/national-security/fifth-generation-warfare>
- Baig, A. (2021, April 18). *Misinformation Warfare - #CivilWarinPakistan trends with 61% tweets coming from India; New Delhi contributes the highest number*. Digital Rights Monitor. <https://digitalrightsmonitor.pk/misinformation-warfare-civilwarinpakistan-trends-with-61-tweets-coming-from-india-new-delhi-contributes-the-highest-number/>
- Bajwa, F. (2018). Analysis of Indian Films Propaganda against Muslims and Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 2(I), 369–380. [https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2018\(2-1\)30](https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2018(2-1)30)
- bdnews24.com. (2011, February 23). "Agartala conspiracy case was not false." Bdnews24.com. <https://bdnews24.com/bangladesh/agartala-conspiracy-case-was-not-false>
- Bennett-Jones, O. (2015, June 24). Pakistan's MQM "received Indian funding." *BBC News*. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-33148880>
- Bhattacharjee, K. (2019, July 3). Explained: The Baloch Liberation Army. *The Hindu*. <https://www.thehindu.com/news/international/explained-the-baloch-liberation-army/article61599528.ece>
- editor. (2019, February 17). *Worst ever Cyber Attack on Pakistan - Indian Hackers in response to Pulwama Terror Attack*. The October Sky. <https://www.theoctobersky.com/featured-stories/worst-ever-cyber-attack-on-pakistan-indian-hackers-in-response-to-pulwama->

terror-attack

- Canada, G. A. (2024, February 13). *Department of National Defence and the Canadian Armed Forces Implementation Plan for Canada's National Action Plan on Women, Peace and Security – 2023 to 2029*. GAC. <https://www.international.gc.ca/transparency-transparence/women-peace-security-femmes-paix-securite/2023-2029-implementation-plans-mise-ceuvre-dnd.aspx?lang=eng>
- Chivvis, C. (2017). *Understanding Russian “Hybrid Warfare” And What Can Be Done About it*. https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/testimonies/CT400/CT468/RAND_CT468.pdf
- Concordiam, per. (2023, July 12). *Modern Deterrence - per Concordiam*. PerConcodium. <https://perconcordiam.com/modern-deterrence/>
- Derleth, J. (2020, September). *Russian New Generation Warfare Deterring and Winning at the Tactical Level*. Army University Press. <https://www.armyupress.army.mil/Journals/Military-Review/English-Edition-Archives/September-October-2020/Derleth-New-Generation-War/>
- Dagia, N. (2022, January 18). *Pakistan's National Security Policy Prioritizes Economic Security*. TheDiplomat.com. <https://thediplomat.com/2022/01/pakistans-national-security-policy-prioritizes-economic-security/>
- Dawn.com. (2020, December 3). *Pakistan being subjected to 5th-generation warfare in “massive way” but we are aware of threats: DG ISPR*. DAWN.COM. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1593804>
- Elsa, E. (2019, September 2). *The case of Kulbushan Jadhav in Pakistan: Everything you need to know*. Gulfnews.com. <https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/the-case-of-kulbushan-jadhav-in-pakistan-everything-you-need-to-know-1.66160866>
- Fox, J. M. (2023). *Deviant Voices: News Agency Coverage of Controversial Public Figures (2012-2022)* [Regent University].
- Fifth generation warfare a big challenge: DG ISPR*. (2020, December 4). Wwww.thenews.com.pk. <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/753179-fifth-generation-warfare-a-big-challenge-ispr-dg>
- Gichki, A. A. (2022). The Role of Media in the Fifth Generation Warfare: The Indian Information War against Pakistan. *Journal of Mass Communication Department, Dept of Mass Communication, University of Karachi*, 27, 50-68.

- Gray, C. S. (2016). *The strategy bridge : theory for practice*. Oxford University Press.
- Guterres, A. (2019). UNITED NATIONS STRATEGY AND PLAN OF ACTION ON HATE SPEECH. In *United Nations* (pp. 1–5). <https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/UN%20Strategy%20and%20Plan%20of%20Action%20on%20Hate%20Speech%2018%20June%20SYNOPSIS.pdf>
- Guala, G. (2014, February 25). *The Drone War: Pakistani Public Attitudes toward American Drone Strikes in Pakistan*. Humanitarian Library. <https://www.humanitarianlibrary.org/resource/drone>
- Gen, L. (2024, June 15). *5TH Generation Warfare Needs Tech-Lingua strategists - The Sunday Guardian Live*. The Sunday Guardian Live. <https://sundayguardianlive.com/business/5th-generation-warfare-needs-tech-lingua-strategists>
- Handler, S. (2023, January 30). *The 5×5—China’s cyber operations*. Atlantic Council. <https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/content-series/the-5x5/the-5x5-chinas-cyber-operations/>
- Haider, M. W., Azad, T. M., & Warrich, H. (2020). A Critical Review of Hybrid Warfare: Challenges to Pakistan. *Global Mass Communication Review*, 5(4), 72-90.
- Haider, Muhammad & Azad, Tahir Mahmood. (2021). Generational Model of Warfare and Evolution of Hybrid Warfare: A Review of Diverse Perspectives. *Researchgate*. 12-26. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/357381148_Generational_Model_of_Warfare_and_Evolution_of_Hybrid_Warfare_A_Review_of_Diverse_Perspectives
- Hadjitodorov, Stefan & Sokolov, Martin. (2018). Blending New-generation Warfare and Soft Power: Hybrid Dimensions of Russia-Bulgaria Relations. *Connections: The Quarterly Journal*, 17(1), 5-19. 10.11610/Connections.17.1.01.
- Hoffman, F. G. (2014). Hybrid warfare and challenges. In *Strategic Studies* (pp. 329-337). Routledge.
- Husain, S. S., Begum, S. M., Hussain, F., Khanam, M., & Nazish, S. A. (2022). Fifth Generation war between India and Pakistan in the perspective of Regional Security: A Study of Daily Dawn and Times of India's News Coverage.(January 1st. 2020 to December 31st. 2021). *Indian Journal of Economics and Business*, 21(2).
- Hussain, S., Roofi, Y., Faheem, F., & Qamar, M. T. R. (2023). Hybrid Warfare in Pakistan: How it’s Effecting CPEC. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(2), 1780–1787-1780–1787.

- Hafiz, A. (2023, August 26). *Pakistan's New Frontier: Navigating 5th Generation Warfare - The Islamabad Telegraph is a current-affairs magazine for the Asia-Pacific, with news and analysis on Geopolitics, Security and Foreign Affairs across the region.* The Islamabad Telegraph. <https://theislamabadtelegraph.com/2023/08/pakistans-new-frontier-navigating-5th-generation-warfare/>
- Humayun, H. (2019). Pakistan's Susceptibility to 5th Generation Hybrid Warfare due to its Prevailing Fault Lines: A Comparative Analysis with Yugoslavia. *NUST Journal of International Peace & Stability*, 1(1), 27–40. <https://doi.org/njips.nust.edu.pk>
- Hassan, S. R. (2017, April 26). *India, Afghanistan gave help to Pakistani Taliban, says group's ex-spokesman.* Reuters. <https://www.reuters.com/article/idUSKBN17T0EA/>
- Indian forces fought along Mukti Bahini: Modi.* (2015, June 8). [Www.thenews.com.pk](http://www.thenews.com.pk). <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/12923-indian-forces-fought-along-mukti-bahini-modi>
- International Trade Administration. (2024, January 12). *Pakistan - Cybersecurity.* [Www.trade.gov](http://www.trade.gov). <https://www.trade.gov/country-commercial-guides/pakistan-cybersecurity>
- Iqbal, G. (2023, June 21). *Assessing Pakistan's Cyber Security Landscape.* Modern Diplomacy. <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2023/06/21/assessing-pakistans-cyber-security-landscape/>
- Iqbal, S. (2023, March 27). *The developing cybersecurity framework in Pakistan.* [Www.ibanet.org](http://www.ibanet.org). <https://www.ibanet.org/Developing-cybersecurity-framework-in-Pakistan>
- Jahangir, J., & Bashir, N. (2022). Fifth Generation and Hybrid Warfare: Response Strategy of Pakistan. *Academic Journal of Social Sciences (AJSS)*, 6(2), 059-076. <https://doi.org/10.54692/ajss.2022.06021753>
- Jamal, A. (2022, March 28). *Emerging disinformation and cybersecurity threats to Pakistan.* [Www.ir-ia.com](http://www.ir-ia.com). <https://www.ir-ia.com/Emerging-disinformation-and-cybersecurity-threats-to-Pakistan.html>
- Jamal, N. (2024, February 23). *PTA Launches the First Cybersecurity Strategy 2023-2028 for Telecoms.* Aurora Magazine. <https://aurora.dawn.com/news/1145051>
- Johnson, R. B., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Turner, L. A. (2007). Toward a definition of mixed methods research. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 1(2), 112–133.
- Jackson, J. B., Dean. (2024, January 31). *Countering Disinformation Effectively: An Evidence-Based Policy Guide.* Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.

<https://carnegieendowment.org/2024/01/31/countering-disinformation-effectively-evidence-based-policy-guide-pub-91476>

- Khan, M. I. A. (2019). CYBER-WARFARE: IMPLICATIONS FOR THE NATIONAL SECURITY OF PAKISTAN. *NDU Journal*.
- Khan, N. F., Ikram, N., Saleem, S., & Zafar, S. (2023). Cyber-security and risky behaviors in a developing country context: A Pakistani perspective. *Security Journal*, 36(2), 373-405.
- Kamboh, M., Mustafa, G., & Rasul, M. F. (2021). 5th Generation Warfare and Issues of National Integration in Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5(1), 802–814. https://www.academia.edu/45629883/5th_Generation_Warfare_and_Issues_of_National_Integration_in_Pakistan
- Khalid, Z. (2022, February 20). *Examining the National Security Policy of Pakistan 2022-2026*. Centre for Strategic and Contemporary Research. <https://cscr.pk/explore/themes/defense-security/examining-the-national-security-policy-of-pakistan-2022-2026/>
- Khan, A. (2021, August 17). *Pakistan's National Cyber Security Policy 2021: What Is Achieved And What Is Yet To Achieved – OpEd*. Eurasia Review. <https://www.eurasiareview.com/17082021-pakistans-national-cyber-security-policy-2021-what-is-achieved-and-what-is-yet-to-achieved-oped/>
- Khan, H., & Dissertation, A. (2021). CRITICAL STUDY OF PROPAGANDA & HYBRID / 5 TH GENERATION WAR FOR THE PURPOSE OF NARRATIVE BUILDING. In *Selinus University*. <https://www.uniselinus.education/sites/default/files/2021-11/hamid%20khan.pdf>
- Khetran, M. S. (2017). Indian Interference in Balochistan: Analysing the Evidence and Implications for Pakistan. *Strategic Studies*, 37(3), 112–125. https://www.jstor.org/stable/48537560?Seq=1#metadata_info_ta
- Kausar, S., Hussain Shah, Dr. M., & Waqas, M. (2021). THE PORTRAYAL OF TALIBAN IN THE EDITORIALS OF ENGLISH PRESS OF PAKISTAN: AN EVALUATION FROM 11 SEPTEMBER 2001 TO 30 SEPTEMBER 2007. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 4(3). <https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v4i3.235>
- Krishnan, A. (2022). Fifth Generation Warfare, Hybrid Warfare, and Gray Zone Conflict: A Comparison. *Journal of Strategic Security*, 15(4), 14–31. <https://doi.org/10.5038/1944-0472.15.4.2013>

- Linkov, I., & Kott, A. (2019). Fundamental concepts of cyber resilience: Introduction and overview. *Cyber resilience of systems and networks*, 1-25.
- Liu, F., & Liu, R. (2019). China, the United States, and order transition in East Asia: An economy-security Nexus approach. *The Pacific Review*, 32(6), 972-995.
- Layton, P., Gpcapt, D., & Millar. (2017). Fifth Generation Air Warfare. In *ROYAL AUSTRALIAN AIR FORCE AIR POWER DEVELOPMENT CENTRE*.
<https://airpower.airforce.gov.au/sites/default/files/2021-03/WP43-Fifth-Generation-Air-Warfare.pdf>
- Lyu, D. Z. (2024, January 5). *5th Generation War and Global Challenges*. Stratheia.
<https://stratheia.com/5th-generation-war-and-global-challenges/>
- Maaz, N. (2018). 5 GW and hybrid warfare its implications and response options.
- Mitra, J. (2023). *Conventional Military Strategy in the Third Nuclear Age*. Taylor & Francis.
- Montgomery , M., & Borghard, E. (2021, July 1). *Cyber Threats and Vulnerabilities to Conventional and Strategic Deterrence*. National Defense University.
<https://www.ndu.edu/News/Article-View/Article/2684986/cyber-threats-and-vulnerabilities-to-conventional-and-strategic-deterrence/>
- McLeod, S. (2023, December 18). *Qualitative Vs Quantitative Research Methods & Data Analysis*. Simply Psychology. <https://www.simplypsychology.org/qualitative-quantitative.html>
- Maseehullah, Bibi, A., & Meer, H. (2023). Fifth Generation War Against Pakistan Its Dynamics, Implications and Response by State Institutions. *Review of Education, Administration & Law*, 6(1), 41–50. <https://doi.org/10.47067/real.v6i1.302>
- Matloob, N., Nayab Matloob, & Ishaq, S. (2023). Hybrid Warfare: Strategies and Counterstrategies in the India-Pakistan Rivalry. *Journal of Peace and Diplomacy*, 4(1), 78–99. <https://doi.org/10.59111/jpd.004.01.043>
- Ministry of Information technology and telecommunication. (2021). Government of Pakistan National Cyber Security Policy 2021. In *MINISTRY OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY & TELECOMMUNICATION* (pp. 1–19).
<https://moitt.gov.pk/SiteImage/Misc/files/National%20Cyber%20Security%20Policy%202021%20Final.pdf>

- Muhammad, S. (2024). Pakistan in the Crosshairs and the Rising Stakes of Strategic Information Warfare. *Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 12(1), 25–47. <https://doi.org/10.52015/jrss.12i1.235>
- Malik, M. R. (2020, March 11). *A perspective on Aurat March*. The Nation. <https://www.nation.com.pk/12-Mar-2020/a-perspective-on-aurat-march>
- Maurer, T., & Nelson, A. (2021, March). *The Global Cyber Threat to Financial Systems – IMF F&D*. International Monetary Fund. <https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/fandd/2021/03/global-cyber-threat-to-financial-systems-maurer.htm>
- NATO. (2021, March 16). *NATO's response to hybrid threats*. NATO. https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/topics_156338.htm
- Nye, J. (2008, August 15). *Public diplomacy and soft power - Diplo Resource*. DIPLO. <https://www.diplomacy.edu/resource/public-diplomacy-and-soft-power/>
- Nye, J. (2019). *Soft Power and the Public Diplomacy Revisited*. Wwww.hks.harvard.edu. <https://www.hks.harvard.edu/publications/soft-power-and-public-diplomacy-revisited>
- Nadeem, M. A., Mustafa, G., & Kakar, A. (2021). Fifth Generation Warfare and its Challenges to Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 4(1).
- Naseer, R., Amin, M., & Shaheen, K. (2020). CYBER SECURITY CHALLENGES IN SOUTH ASIA AND ROOM FOR CYBER DIPLOMACY. *NDU Journal*, 34, 97-114.
- Nayak, B. S., & Chakraborty, D. (2023). *Interdisciplinary reflections on South Asian transitions: exploring the rise of far right ideology*. Springer Nature.
- Nemecek, N. (2023). *The Themes and Peculiarities of the Islamic State's Propaganda* Royal Roads University (Canada)].
- Nadeem, M. A., Mustafa, D. G., & Kakar, D. A. (2021). Fifth Generation Warfare and its Challenges to Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v4i1.118>
- Naz, I. H. (2021). FOREIGN POLICY IN HYBRID WARFARE ENVIRONMENT – WAY FORWARD FOR PAKISTAN. *Margalla Papers*, 25(1), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.54690/margallapapers.25.1.46>
- National Action Plan (NAP) to Combat Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance . (2019). In *Republic of South Africa*.

- <https://www.justice.gov.za/nap/docs/NAP-20190313.pdf>
- National Security Division. (2022). National Security Policy of Pakistan 2022-2026. In *National Security Division Government of Pakistan* (pp. 1–62). <https://static.theprint.in/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/NSP.pdf>
- Nawaz, A., Zeeshan, M., & Akhlaq, S. (2023). Fifth-Generation Warfare: A Quagmire and Fiasco to National Solidity of Pakistan. *A Research Journal of South Asian Studies* 53 *South Asian Studies a Research Journal of South Asian Studies*, 38(1), 53–72. https://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/csas/PDF/4_38_1_23.pdf
- O'Brien, D. (2023, April 13). *The disinformation playbook: A government that wants to fact check the fact-checkers*. The Indian Express. <https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/disinformation-playbook-government-that-wants-to-fact-check-fact-checkers-8554978/>
- Poudel, J. (2021). *Changing international system: The role of echnology in the 21st century global power relations* Department of International Relations and Diplomacy].
- Pradhan, S. D. (2021, November 21). Pak National Cyber Security Policy 2021: Main elements. *The Times of India*. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/blogs/ChanakyaCode/pak-national-cyber-security-policy-2021-main-elements/>
- Prevent, Counter, and Respond-NNSA's Plan to Reduce Global Nuclear Threats. (2023). In *Department of Energy/National Nuclear Security Administration*. US Department of Energy. https://www.energy.gov/sites/default/files/2023-09/FY2023_NPCR.pdf
- Qureshi, W. (2019). Fourth-and Fifth-Generation Warfare: Technology and Fourth-and Fifth-Generation Warfare: Technology and Perceptions Perceptions. *San Diego International Law Journal San Diego International Law Journal*, 21(1), 187–216. <https://digital.sandiego.edu/ilj/vol21/iss1/7/>
- Rajorshi, R. (2023). INDIA-RUSSIA DEFENSE PARTNERSHIP: NEW CHALLENGES AND FUTURE PROSPECTS. *Вестник МГИМО Университета*, 16(2), 120-141.
- Renz, B. (2019). Russian “Hybrid Warfare”: Resurgence and Politicisation. *The RUSI Journal*, 164(3), 70–71. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03071847.2019.1643542>
- Rafiq, A., & Mustafa, M. (2021). THE NATIONAL CYBER SECURITY POLICY OF PAKISTAN 2021. In *ISSI*. https://issi.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2021/10/IB_Aamna_Oct_15_2021.pdf

- Rehman, A. (2022). Media and Fifth-generation Warfare: A Case Study of Indian Disinformation Campaign Against Balochistan. *Journal of Mass Communication*, 26, 97–115.
- Rizvi, S. Q. A. (2020, December 9). *India's 5th Generation War & Pak challenges ?* Pakistan Observer. <https://pakobserver.net/indias-5th-generation-war-pak-challenges/>
- Reporter, S. (2017, November 3). *Pakistan summons UK envoy to lodge protest*. Daily Times. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/134135/pakistan-summons-uk-envoy-lodge-protest/>
- Research, S. R. (2024, April 22). *Xi attempts to Transform PLA to a 5th Generation Warfare Force*. Security Risks Asia. <https://www.security-risks.com/post/xi-attempts-to-transform-pla-to-a-5th-generation-warfare-force>
- Stoutland, P. (n.d.). *Addressing Cyber-Nuclear Security Threats*. The Nuclear Threat Initiative. <https://www.nti.org/about/programs-projects/project/addressing-cyber-nuclear-security-threats/>
- Seely, R. (2017). Defining Contemporary Russian Warfare. *The RUSI Journal*, 162(1), 50–59. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03071847.2017.1301634>
- Strachan, H. F. A. (2019). Strategy in theory; strategy in practice. *Research-Repository.st-andrews.ac.uk*, 42(2). <https://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/handle/10023/21130>
- Saboor, A., Ali, S., & Bhutto, M. M. (2022). US-China Strategic Rivalry in South Asia: New Challenges for Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 5(2).
- Sumarno, Tonny and Risman, Helda. (2020). The Universal War Strategy in the 5th Generation War in the 4.0 Industry Era (Cyber Threat Case Study). *Journal of Social and Political Sciences*, 3(4). <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3755900>
- Sarfraz, H. (2021, December 26). How India unleashed targeted social media campaigns against Pakistan. *The Express Tribune*. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2335695/how-india-unleashed-targeted-social-media-campaigns-against-pakistan>
- Sami, W. (2024, April 15). *Pakistan's Cybersecurity Strategy 2021: Progress & Challenges*. Policy Wire. <https://www.policy-wire.com/diagnosis/pakistans-national-cybersecurity-strategy-2021-analyzing-progress-and-challenges/>
- Shafi, D. M., & Dinakhel, D. M. A. (2022). National Security Policy of Pakistan (2022-2026): Introduction and Impact on Political Landscape of Pakistan. *Al-Azhār*, 8(02), 31–41. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7509757>

- Shahzad, B. (2021, September 2). *National cybersecurity policy and 5th generation war*. Pakistan Observer. <https://pakobserver.net/national-cybersecurity-policy-and-5th-generation-war-by-dr-basit-shahzad/>
- Shaikh, M. I. (2021, November 8). *Pakistan's Cybersecurity Policy in 2021: A Review*. ISACA. <https://www.isaca.org/resources/news-and-trends/industry-news/2021/pakistans-cybersecurity-policy-in-2021-a-review>
- Sabir, D. M. (2019, January 4). *Fifth Generation war and media*. E.jang.com.pk. <https://e.jang.com.pk/01-30->
- Sial, S. (2011). *Pak-Afghan Relations Emerging Trends and Future Prospects Pak-Afghan Relations Emerging Trends and Future Prospects Pak-Afghan Relations Emerging Trends and Future Prospects* (pp. 1–14). <https://www.pakpips.com/web/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/164.pdf>
- Tahir, I. A., & Afridi, M. K. (2019). Fifth Generations Warfare (5GW)-The New Dimensions of Enemies Launched Warfare and Security Concern of Pakistan. *Global Regional Review*, 4(1), 250-259.
- t'Serstevens, F., Piccillo, G., & Grigoriev, A. (2022). Fake news zealots: Effect of perception of news on online sharing behavior. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.859534>
- Tackling Hate. (2020). In *Article19.org* (pp. 3–33). <https://www.article19.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/Tackling-Hate-V4-Digital3.pdf>
- The White House. (2022). National Security Strategy. In *The White House* (pp. 1–48). <https://www.whitehouse.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/Biden-Harris-Administrations-National-Security-Strategy-10.2022.pdf>
- Upadhyay, A. (2023). *Amid Changing Nature and Character of War, the Need for Tech-Oriented Military Commanders for India*. ORF, Observer Research Foundation.
- UNESCO. (2023). *Addressing hate speech through education: a guide for policy-makers*. Unesco.org. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000384872>
- United Nations. (n.d.). *OHCHR | OHCHR and freedom of expression vs incitement to hatred: the Rabat Plan of Action*. OHCHR. <https://www.ohchr.org/en/freedom-of-expression>
- United Nations. (2019). *United Nations Office on Genocide Prevention and the Responsibility to Protect*. Un.org. <https://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/hate-speech-strategy.shtml>

- VAN DER VENNE, T. (2021, November 30). *Old Wine, New Bottles: A Theoretical Analysis of Hybrid Warfare*. E-International Relations. <https://www.e-ir.info/2021/11/30/old-wine-new-bottles-a-theoretical-analysis-of-hybrid-warfare/>
- WHO IS KULBHUSHAN JADHAV. (n.d.). *Business Standard India*. <https://www.business-standard.com/about/who-is-kulbhushan-jadhav>
- Zahid, F. (2015, July 10). *The Successes and Failures of Pakistan's Operation Zarb-e-Azb*. Webarchive.archive.unhcr.org; Jamestown Foundation. <https://webarchive.archive.unhcr.org/20240513112628/https://www.refworld.org/docid/55a4cfa74.html>
- Zeb, F. (2015, September 17). *Zarb-e-Azb: One year On*. ACLED. <https://acleddata.com/2015/09/17/zarb-e-azb-one-year-on/>
- Zakaria, A. (2019, December 16). *Remembering the war of 1971 in East Pakistan*. Wwww.aljazeera.com. <https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2019/12/16/remembering-the-war-of-1971-in-east-pakistan>